



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jan H. Gardner
County Executive

Steven C. Horn, Division Director
Kimberly Golden Brandt, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

July 6, 2022

Address: 9057 Myersville Road, Myersville **Meeting Date:** August 3, 2022

Applicant: Eric Scott Winnette & Anthony Moscato, Jr. **Report Date:** July 15, 2022

Case No.: COA 22-07 **Staff:** Amanda Whitmore

Request: Replace posts, balusters, and rails on house porch

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Henry Brandenburg property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 21-04) on November 16, 2021. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house, a smoke house, spring and wash house, bake oven/shed, and a non-contributing chicken coop. The property was built in circa 1833-1848 with a rear wing addition added to the house circa 1860. The front porch was added circa 1875. The property is accessed from Myersville Road.

Previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
A-COA #22-01	04/01/2022	Eric Scott Winnette & Anthony Moscato, Jr.	Approved
Request to replace the front porch decking and skirt board in-kind, repair the porch columns, repair, and where needed, replace window sills in-kind, and paint new work, porch columns, and all window sills.			
COA # 22-06	07/06/2022	Eric Scott Winnette & Anthony Moscato, Jr.	Approved
Request to replace existing brick step with wooden step and add wooden handrail at front porch; replace existing wood storm door on the side entry of the			

house in-kind; replace the asphalt shingle roof on the smokehouse with wood shake or standing seam; and replace six feet of flooring on spring and wash house porch, repair damaged bard and batten siding on spring and wash house; and prime and paint the building.



Fig. 1: Subject property.

REQUEST

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested to replace the posts, balusters, and rails on the front porch of the house. The posts would replicate posts based on a 1970s photograph that are 4" by 4". The balusters will be boxed 1" by 1" with a simple top rail and v-topped bottom rail.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and

its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.

- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

STAFF EVALUATION

The applicant proposes exterior alterations to the front porch railings, balusters, and posts of the house. The applicant indicates these porch features are poor quality with areas of damage. A 1970's photograph submitted with the application shows porch posts that are different from the porch posts currently on the house, indicating that the current posts are not original.

The applicant proposes to replace the existing posts with new posts that replicate the posts based on the 1970s photograph. The replicated posts would be 4" by 4" square at the bottom and then milled round and taper toward the top. The balusters will be 1" by 1" boxed balusters that join with a simple top rail and a v-topped bottom rail.

Staff analysis of the *Guidelines* for this project is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4F2: Porches: Porch Elements	Yes	While the <i>Guidelines</i> state that deteriorated porch elements should be repaired rather than replaced, the applicant has shown that these features are not historically significant to the house and were added within the last 50 years. The <i>Guidelines</i> in this section further state that historic documentation or physical evidence should be used when replicating a missing porch feature. The older photograph is good documentation that the existing porch elements are not original and restoring an earlier look would be appropriate since it is substantiated by the photograph.
4F3: Porches: Steps and Railings	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that if replacement of railings is necessary, they should be replaced in-kind. The existing balusters and rails are a simple square design, and they appear to be that shape in the 1970's photograph as well. The railings are designed simply and in keeping with the historic character of the building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff finds that the proposed project would not have a significant impact to the character of the historic property, and recommends approval of COA 22-07. This recommendation is made to address the *Guidelines* as noted above, as well as Chapter 1-23-7 of the Frederick County Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Application for Certificate of Appropriateness and Commission Review having found that the proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource, does not seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures, and is compatible in character to the property and with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* #2, #6, and #9.