



## FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

### DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jan H. Gardner  
County Executive

Steven C. Horn, Division Director  
Kimberly Golden Brandt, Director

### FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### STAFF REPORT

August 3, 2022

**Address:** 1341 Jefferson Pike, Knoxville      **Meeting Date:** August 3, 2022  
**Applicant:** Keith K. Wilson      **Report Date:** July 15, 2022  
**Case No.:** COA 22-08      **Staff:** Beau Lockard  
**Request:** Replace front porch asphalt shingle roof with standing seam metal roof, install snow birds on same metal roof

#### PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Petersville Methodist Episcopal Church property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 01-02) on November 13, 2001. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic church and a garage. The property was built in circa 1850. The property is accessed from Jefferson Pike.

Previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
A-COA #22-02	07/05/2022	Keith K. Wilson	Approved
Request to replace the main church roof, garage roof, pantry roof, and side porch roof with in-kind metal roofs			
COA #02-04	05/02/2002	Joan P. Porter	
Installing an iron fence and planting trees and shrubs for landscaping			



**Fig. 1: Subject property.**

## **REQUEST**

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested to:

- 1) Replace the existing black asphalt shingle roof on front porch roof with Englert Double Lock Standing Seam metal roof; install new custom bent eave and rake flashings; Install LifeTime Tool Square Lock snow guards, two per seam, along gutter edges.

## **APPLICABLE GUIDELINES**

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

### **Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B**

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

### **Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines**

The *Guidelines* contain a Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. For this case, please refer to Chapter 4, Section B, Subheading 4: "In cases where...the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission." Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

## **STAFF EVALUATION**

The applicant proposes exterior alterations to a contributing structure on the property.

### **Front Porch Roof Replacement**

Currently, the roof of the front porch of the church is an asphalt shingle roof. The specific age of the asphalt shingles was not provided by the applicant. A 1980s photograph submitted as part of the original MIHP form shows the asphalt shingle roof. However, this building was constructed circa 1850 and asphalt shingle roofs began being used in 1903 and did not grow in popularity until the 1920s. This popularity increase occurred as a part of the National Board of Fire Underwriters' campaign to eliminate wood-shingled roofs. The applicant proposes to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof. The standing seam metal roof would have 21" wide panels and have 1" high seams. The color would be Forest Green. These specifications would bring the front porch roof into material and design alignment with the other ancillary and outbuilding roofs. If the HPC approves the change in material from asphalt shingle to standing seam metal, the applicant would like to install snow birds on that roof. Snow birds are used to prevent snow from falling off the edge of a roof in large sheets. The front gable main roof currently has snow birds.

Staff analysis of the *Guidelines* for this project is as follows:

<b>Guideline</b>	<b>Met?</b>	<b>Comments</b>
4B3: Roofs: Roofing Materials	Mostly	While the <i>Guidelines</i> state that asphalt shingles are common on historic building built after their introduction, it also states that they have a significantly shorter life than other traditional roofing materials. It also states that asphalt shingles are not an acceptable replacement for historic roofing. The roof was not originally asphalt shingle, but evidence of the original material was not submitted as part of this COA and may be unknown.
4B4: Roofs: Roof Maintenance, Repair, and Replacement	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, "In cases where the original material is no longer available, or the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission." Since the current material is

		not original and the original material is unknown, the Commission can consider changing the roofing material to best match the building's historic character and form. The other ancillary and outbuilding roofs are standing seam metal roofs.
8A2: Alternative Materials for Historic Buildings and Ancillary Structures	Mostly	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that alternative materials should be visually and physically compatible with the original material and that the appearance of the alternative material should match the color, texture, size, shape, and profile of the original material. However, the original material of the front porch roof is unknown. Changing the front porch roof to a standing seam metal roof would make it match the other ancillary and outbuilding roofs. Since the original material is unknown, it is up to the Commission to decide if matching the front porch roof with the other ancillary and outbuilding roofs is appropriate.
4B2: Roofs: Associated Elements	Mostly	While the <i>Guidelines</i> state that snow birds are considered character defining features of historic buildings and that if replaced, they should match the original in design and material. Since the original roof material of the front porch is unknown it is unknown if it originally had snow birds. The main roof of the historic church has snow birds. Besides the functional use of snow birds, they would make the roof appear more in line with the historic roof design of the main roof.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff finds that the proposed project would not have a significant impact to the character of the historic property, and recommends approval of COA 22-08.