



## FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

### DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jan H. Gardner  
County Executive

Steven C. Horn, Division Director  
Kimberly Golden Brandt, Director

### FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

### STAFF REPORT

August 3, 2022

**Address:** 7127 Autumn Leaf Ln, Frederick      **Meeting Date:** August 3, 2022  
**Applicant:** Eric and Gwen Gleysteen      **Report Date:** July 15, 2022  
**Case No.:** COA 22-09      **Staff:** Beau Lockard  
**Request:** Replace asphalt shingle main and porch roof with standing seam metal roof, remove non-contributing sunroom

#### PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Samuel Fleming House property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 21-03) on July 7, 2021. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house, a non-contributing garage, and a non-contributing pool house and pool. The property was built in 1771 based on a panel in the north gable, with a rear wing added in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. The property is accessed from Autumn Leaf Lane.

Previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
A-COA #21-06	10/22/2021	Eric and Gwen Gleysteen	Approved
Removal of a silver maple tree located between the house and the garage			
COA #21-07	09/01/2021	Eric and Gwen Gleysteen	Approved
Alter the façade of the former garage to include removing the first-floor window and door, infilling the garage doors, reframing the façade to center two new windows and door, and removing existing siding on the entire structure and replacing it with hardie-plank siding. The replacement windows will be either vinyl-clad or aluminum-clad and have either simulated divided lites with the grilles attached to the exterior glass			

or be one-over-one windows with no grilles. The corner moldings and window trim will be smooth cement boards. The lights will be a contemporary design.



**Fig. 1: Subject property.**

## **REQUEST**

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested to:

- 1) Replace the existing black asphalt shingle roof with galvanized standing seam metal roof; install new custom bent eave and rake flashings; and install snow guards
- 2) Remove non-contributing sunroom

## **APPLICABLE GUIDELINES**

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

### **Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B**

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

### **Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines**

The *Guidelines* contain a Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. For this case, please refer to Chapter 4, Section B, Subheading 4: "In cases where...the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission." The *Guidelines* also discuss demolition in Chapter 10. For this case, please look at Chapter 10, Section H. Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

### **STAFF EVALUATION**

The applicant proposes exterior alterations to a contributing structure on the property. Each project will be evaluated separately below.

#### **Main and Porch Roof Replacement**

Currently, both the main and porch roofs of the house are asphalt shingles. The specific age of the asphalt shingle was not provided by the applicant. The oldest picture of the roof on file is from 1993 and shows the asphalt shingle roof. The building was constructed 1771 and the addition was built in the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Asphalt shingle roofs began being used in 1903 and did not grow in popularity until the 1920s. This popularity increase occurred as a part of the National Board of Fire Underwriters' campaign to eliminate wood-shingled roofs. The applicant proposes to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof. The current roof is in poor condition and has multiple temporary patches. The standing seam metal roof would have 21" wide panels of 24-gauge metal and 1" high seams. The proposed project would also work to protect and rehabilitate the wooden sub roof structure. Matching snow birds would also be added to the roof.

Staff analysis of the *Guidelines* for this project is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4B3: Roofs: Roofing Materials	Mostly	While the <i>Guidelines</i> state that asphalt shingles are common on historic building built after their introduction, it also states that they have a significantly shorter life than other traditional roofing materials. It also states that asphalt shingles are not an acceptable replacement for historic roofing. The roof was not originally asphalt shingle, but evidence of the original material was not submitted as part of this COA and may be unknown.
4B4: Roofs: Roof Maintenance, Repair, and Replacement	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, "In cases where the original material is no longer available, or the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission." Since the current material is not original and the original material is unknown, the Commission can consider changing the roofing material to best match the building's historic character and form. The proposed roof would also provide long term protection of the historic structure that the current roof is damaging.
8A2: Alternative Materials for Historic Buildings and Ancillary Structures	Somewhat	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that alternative materials should be visually and physically compatible with the original material and that the appearance of the alternative material should match the color, texture, size, shape, and profile of the original material. However, the original material of the roof is unknown. Changing the roof to a standing seam metal roof would be historically possible for the 19 <sup>th</sup> century addition, but unlikely for the original 1771 roof. The roof has changed material at least twice.

### **Removal of Sunroom**

Currently there is a second-floor sunroom on the north elevation of the historic house. This structure was built during the 1980s. The sunroom is in poor condition and is no longer watertight, causing damage in the walls below the sunroom. The applicant requests

approval to remove the sunroom and place a temporary roof covering to protect the rest of the house while they decide what to put in the sunroom's place. This work is not on a publicly viewable elevation.

Guideline	Met?	Comments
10H1: Demolition: Non-Contributing Resources	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that demolition of a non-contributing resource may be approved if the integrity of the historic property and landscape will not be compromised. The poor condition of the sunroom means that demolition and stabilization of the roof will protect and preserve the historic house more than leaving the non-contributing sunroom in its current state.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff finds that the proposed projects would not have a significant impact to the character of the historic property, and recommends approval of COA 22-09.