



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

Gary W. Hessong, Acting Division Director

Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

July 5, 2023

Address: 7127 Autumn Leaf Ln, Frederick

Meeting Date: July 5, 2023

Applicant: Eric and Gwen Gleysteen

Report Date: May 25, 2022

Case No.: N/A

Staff: Beau Lockard

Request: Input on potential addition and roof design and location

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Samuel Fleming House property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 21-03) on July 7, 2021. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house, a non-contributing garage, and a non-contributing pool house and pool. The property was built in 1771 based on a panel in the north gable with a rear wing addition, which was added in the late 19th century. The property is accessed from Autumn Leaf Ln.



Figure 1: Subject property.

Frederick County: Rich History, Bright Future

30 North Market Street, Frederick, MD 21701 • 301-600-1138 • Fax 301-600-1645

www.FrederickCountyMD.gov

REQUEST

1. Applicant is requesting input on a potential addition concept plan.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. While this is not a Certificate of Appropriateness review, the Commissioners should keep in mind all applicable guidelines when providing input for the applicant. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) and Additions and New Construction (Chapter 7) that should be referred to when reviewing the addition concept plan.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

SPECIFIC GUIDELINE ASSISTANCE

The following addition concept plan overview should be reviewed using Chapter 7, on Additions and New Construction, for location, design, and form, and Chapter 4, on Building Exteriors, for the proposed roof and window design. Since this is a workshop, staff is not offering guidance.

The applicant is seeking guidance on any non-starter elements of the proposed plan from the commission. This is not a Certificate of Appropriateness application, so no decision needs to be made by the commission. Guidance on what a potential COA application should include may also be offered.

1. Location and Scale: The applicant is proposing to place the addition onto, and replacing, the 1980s addition located on the southwest corner of the historic house. It would extent to the south, just past the south porch alignment.

Applicable Design Guidelines: 7A: Additions and New Construction, Additions. “Additions should be located on rear or secondary building elevations and out of view from a public right-of-way. Additions will not be approved on public-facing elevations. Historic walls and other building fabric shall not be damaged to allow for the construction of an

addition and the addition should be reversible without loss of historic materials.” “Additions should appear subordinate to the main building and not overpower it.”

2. Siding Material: The applicant is considering continuing with James Hardie plank siding as was used on the secondary structure on the property, but also thinking about stucco; designers are wondering if vertical metal siding is out of the question. The existing building's exterior material is painted stone and brick.

Applicable Design Guidelines: 7A: *Additions and New Construction, Additions.* “*The design of building additions shall be compatible and sympathetic to the character of the existing building in massing, form, scale, detailing, and materiality. The addition should be distinguishable from the historic building and not imitate historic features.*” 7D: *Additions and New Construction, Material and Detailing.* “*The materials and detailing of new construction should complement those found in the neighborhood or other buildings on the site.*”

3. Windows, Door, and Skylight: The plan shows nine-over-nine double hung windows on the addition elevation and a door on the east elevation off the porch. The applicant states that they are not proposing a specific approach to windows yet and is looking for feedback. They also want to know about the possibility of adding a skylight to the addition roof.

Applicable Design Guidelines: 7D: *Additions and New Construction, Form and Features.* “*Window and door openings, porches, roof elements, and other features of new buildings should be scaled appropriately and create a similar order and rhythm to the historic buildings found nearby. The proportion of solid wall to window openings should also complement that of the neighboring buildings. Primary building entrances should be located and detailed similarly to the historic context.*” 4B2 *Building Exteriors, Roofs, Associated Elements.* “*New skylights on an historic building should not be located on a primary roof elevation if the roof is pitched or visible. New skylights should sit flush with the roof plane and have frames to match the color of the roof material. Bubble-type skylights should not be used.*”

4. Roof Design: The addition plan is proposing a shed roof off the historic 1850s addition roof. It would partially cover the historic 1771 house roof and fully cover the southwest corner at its associated elements, including the cornice. The proposed roof for the addition is designed to retain all the historic elements under the proposed roof. If the addition was removed, all the historic elements would be preserved. No historic materials would be removed or compromised by this design; this roof is designed to be reversible.

Applicable Design Guidelines: 7A: *Additions and New Construction, Additions.* “*Historic walls and other building fabric shall not be damaged to allow for the construction of an addition and the addition should be reversible without loss of historic materials.*” 7D: *Additions and New Construction, Form and Features.* “*The form, pitch, and complexity of new roofs should be consistent with those nearby.*”