



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

Steven C. Horn, Division Director
Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

June 7, 2023

Address: 7127 Autumn Leaf Ln, Frederick **Meeting Date:** August 9, 2023
Applicant: Eric and Gwen Gleysteen **Report Date:** July 25, 2023
Case No.: COA 23-02 **Staff:** Beau Lockard
Request: Install a new four-foot-tall black aluminum fence, with ball caps on all posts, for approximately 173 linear feet, east-west, south of the historic house. Install landscape screening for the first 25 feet closest to Opossumtown Pike.

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Samuel Fleming House property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 21-03) on July 7, 2021. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house, a non-contributing garage, and a non-contributing pool house and pool. The property was built in 1771 based on a panel in the north gable with a rear wing addition, which was added in the late 19th century. The property is accessed from Autumn Leaf Ln.

Previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property include:

| Case Number | Date | Owner | Decision |
|---|------------|-------------------------|----------|
| A-COA #21-06 | 10/22/2021 | Eric and Gwen Gleysteen | Approved |
| Removal of a silver maple tree located between the house and the garage | | | |
| COA#21-08 | 9/1/2021 | Eric and Gwen Gleysteen | Approved |

Alter the façade of the former garage to include removing the first-floor window and door, infilling the garage doors, reframing the façade to center two new windows and door, and remove existing siding on the entire structure and replace it with hardie-plank siding. The replacement windows will be either vinyl-clad or aluminum-clad and have either simulated divided lites with the grilles attached to the exterior glass or be one-over-one windows with no grilles. The corner moldings and window trim will be smooth cement boards. The lights will be a contemporary design.

COA #22-09

8/3/2022

Eric and Gwen
Gleysteen

Approved

Replace asphalt shingle main and porch roof with standing seam metal roof, removal of non-contributing sunroom



Fig. 1: Subject property.

REQUEST

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested to:

1. Install a new four-foot-tall black aluminum fence, with ball caps on all posts, for approximately 173 linear feet, east-west, south of the historic house. Install landscape screening for the first 25 feet closest to Opposumtown Pike.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Landscape and Site Feature Chapter (Chapter 5) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. For this case, please refer to Chapter 5, Section D, Subheading 3: "If fencing is to be installed where none existed, it should be compatible with the overall landscape, including the period, architecture, and intended function." Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF EVALUATION

The applicant is proposing a four-foot-tall black aluminum fence with ball caps on all posts, running 173 linear feet, east-west, south of the historic house. The existing three-rail cedar fence surrounding the perimeter of the property is a recent addition to the landscape, replacing a split two-rail fence that also appears to have been a 21st century installation. The applicant is proposing landscaping screening for 25 feet where the metal fence and cedar fence meet along Opposumtown Pike, plus an additional 5 to 10 feet of phasing out landscape screening.

This new fencing would be interior and would divide the southern yard from the house and its immediate surrounding area. The three-rail cedar perimeter fence is not proposed to be altered by this COA. With the landscaping screening, the new interior fence would be minimally visible from the Opposumtown Pike public right-of-way.

This linear fencing would also partially replace the existing non-conforming stockade fencing surrounding the pool. A complete replacement of the stockade fencing surrounding the pool is expected in the future but is not part of this COA.

The two-rail black metal fence with closed pickets is a more modern style, but the addition of ball caps on all posts emulates other historic, or replicate, fences within the City of Frederick area.

Staff analysis of the *Guidelines* for this project is as follows:

| Guideline | Met? | Comments |
|--|-------------|--|
| 5D3: Landscape and Site Features: Fences | Yes | The <i>Guidelines</i> state that appropriate fence styles include “wood pickets, board fences, wood split rails, and wrought iron and other metal fences.” The Guidelines also state that vinyl fencing is not appropriate and that chain-link and stockade fencing is only appropriate for mid-twentieth century properties. The proposed fencing matches these guidelines as a kind of metal fencing that is not one of the inappropriate styles. |
| 5D3: Landscape and Site Features: Fences | Mostly | The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “If fencing is to be installed where none existed, it should be compatible with the overall landscape, including the period, architecture, and intended function.” There is no existing historic fencing for this proposed fence to emulate and the proposed aluminum fencing is in a more modern style than the period of significance of the property. However, the fencing is design to have low visual impact on the property and be partially screened with vegetation. The applicant is also adding ball caps onto all the posts to emulate more decorative metal fencing styles found elsewhere in the City of Frederick area. The historic context is agricultural, but the current context is urban/suburban and connected to the City of Frederick. |

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff finds that the proposed project would not have a significant impact to the character of the Samuel Fleming historic property.