



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Deborah A. Carpenter, AICP, Division Director

Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

September 6, 2023

Address: 12602 Catoctin Furnace Road, Thurmont **Meeting Date:** September 6, 2023

Applicant: Catoctin Furnace Historic Society **Report Date:** August 17, 2023

Case No.: COA 23-05 **Staff:** Beau Lockard

Request: Removal of non-contributing kitchen addition and non-historic siding

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Hoke House property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 21-03) on April 4, 2023. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house. The property was built circa 1820 and is associated with the expansion of Catoctin Furnace, a colonial-era ironworks that operated for nearly 130 years before shuttering in 1903. The property is accessed from Catoctin Furnace Road.

There have been no previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property.



Fig. 1: Subject property.

Frederick County: Rich History, Bright Future

30 North Market Street, Frederick, MD 21701 • 301-600-1138 • Fax 301-600-1645

www.FrederickCountyMD.gov

REQUEST

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested for:

- 1) Removal of non-contributing kitchen addition
- 2) Removal of non-historic siding

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Demolition Chapter (Chapter 10) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. For specific guidelines from this chapter, please refer to the Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF EVALUATION

The applicant proposes exterior alterations a contributing structure on the property. Each project will be evaluated separately below:

Removal of Non-Contributing Addition

Currently there is a 1960s kitchen addition on the south elevation of the historic house. The applicant requests the approval for the removal of this addition. The kitchen addition was noted as a non-contributing addition in the Hoke House County Register of Historic Places nomination. This would return the historic tenement house to the form associated with the nominated period of significance (1840-1913).

Staff analysis of the *Guidelines* for this project is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
10H1: Demolition: Non-Contributing Resources	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that demolition of a non-contributing resource may be approved if the integrity of the historic property and landscape will not be compromised. Catoctin Furnace Historic Society has previously completed a similar process on the Forgeman's House (CR# 22-01). The removal of the addition will return the historic house to its original form.



Image 1: Hoke House East Elevation with Kitchen Addition Outlined



Image 2: Hoke House South Elevation with Kitchen Outlined

**Removal
of Non-Historic Siding**

Along with the removal of the non-contributing kitchen addition, the applicant is seeking approval to remove the non-historic siding. This will allow for the deeper understanding of the rehabilitation needs of the structure and removes non-conforming siding. While the application describes removal of all the historic siding, this will not be completed at one time. The siding will be removed as needed to understand the rehabilitation needs. Eventually it will be replaced by a compatible siding but that has not been determined at this time and will be part of a separate Certificate of Appropriateness application.

Guideline	Met?	Comments
10H1: Demolition: Non-Contributing Resources	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that demolition of a non-contributing resource may be approved if the integrity of the historic property and landscape will not be compromised. Catoctin Furnace Historic Society has previously completed a similar process on the Collier's Log House (CR# 22-01).
4E: Building Exteriors: Exterior Walls	Yes	The Guidelines state that, "The cladding material...contribute to the historic character of a building." The historic cladding material for the Hoke House was most likely wood siding. The contemporary material is non-historic and non-contributing. Removal of this material would allow for a more compatible siding material to be installed as part of a later COA.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff finds that the proposed project would not have a significant impact to the character of the historic property and recommends approval of this Certificate of Appropriateness.