



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

Deborah A. Carpenter, AICP, Division Director

Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

September 14, 2023

Address: 12520 Catoctin Furnace Rd, Thurmont

Meeting Date: September 14, 2023

Applicant: Kenneth Brink

Report Date: August 31, 2023

Case No.: COA 23-06

Staff: Beau Lockard

Request: Replace asphalt shingled front porch roof with standing seam metal roof and replace 12 non-historic windows with wooden, double-hung windows that match a historic sample.

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Reed-Stitely House was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 22-10) on April 4, 2023. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house, summer kitchen/wash house, springhouse, and garage. The property was built circa 1820. There have been no previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property.



Image 1: Subject Property Aerial View

Frederick County: Rich History, Bright Future

30 North Market Street, Frederick, MD 21701 • 301-600-1138 • Fax 301-600-1645

www.FrederickCountyMD.gov

REQUEST

A Certificate of Appropriateness is requested to replace asphalt shingled front porch roof with 29-gauge G-90 galvanized metal standing seam roof, replace 12 non-historic windows with wooden, double-hung windows that match a historic sample, provided by the applicant, and the restoration of historic springhouse.



Image 2: Reed-Stitely House East and North Elevations from Catoctin Furnace Rd.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.

- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.



Image 3: Reed-Stitely House East elevation

STAFF EVALUATION

Currently, the front porch roof of the house is asphalt shingled. The specific age of the asphalt shingle was not provided by the applicant. However, this building was constructed circa 1820 and asphalt shingle roofs began being used in 1903 and did not grow in popularity until the 1920s. This popularity increase occurred as a part of the National Board of Fire Underwriters' campaign to eliminate wood-shingled roofs. The applicant proposes to replace the asphalt shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof. The new roof would be a 29-gauge G-90 galvanized metal standing seam roof and will be hand formed and hand crimped.

The current windows on the historic house are all non-historic one-over-one double hung vinyl windows that were poorly installed, which threatens the historic fabric of the building. The applicant has a sample six-over-six double hung wood window from the historic house that is being used to recreate the original wooden double hung windows that the vinyl windows replaced. The recreated wooden windows will replace twelve vinyl windows.

The applicant has also asked to restore the historic springhouse but did not provide additional information. Because of this, staff recommends that this not be a part of the COA application that is being reviewed. It is not clear if the restoration would require a COA from the HPC or if the COA can be administratively approved.

Staff analysis of this project against the *Guidelines* is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4B3: Roofs: Roofing Materials	Yes	While the <i>Guidelines</i> state that asphalt shingles are common on historic building built after their introduction, it is also stated that they have a significantly shorter life than other traditional roofing materials and that asphalt shingles are not an acceptable replacement for historic roofing. The roof was not originally asphalt shingle, and the historic roof over the main house is a standing seam metal roof. This likely indicates that the original roofing material was also a metal roof, prior to being replaced by the existing asphalt shingle roof.
4B4: Roofs: Roof Maintenance, Repair, and Replacement	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “In cases ...the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission.” Since the current material is not original and the original material is likely a metal roof, the Commission should consider changing the roofing material to best match the buildings historic character, evidence, and form.
4C3: Openings: Window Repair or Replacement	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that window replacement may be considered if the existing windows do not contribute to the historic character of the building. The vinyl windows that are currently installed in the historic house are not original and the poor installation threatens the historic fabric of the building. Replacement is necessary and would remove non-contributing elements of the historic house.
4C3: Openings: Window Repair or Replacement	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “replacement windows should match the original in size, type, configuration, detailing, and overall appearance and must fit properly in the original opening.” The replacement wooden windows are being recreated based on a six-over-six double hung window that is believed to be an original window. The applicant has provided that historic sample window to the planing mill to recreate 12 wooden windows.



Image 4: Wooden window sample provided by the applicant for recreations.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Commission **approve** COA #23-06 as these project will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource; are compatible in character to the remainder of the structure and to the surrounding area; do not seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures; and are compatible in character to the property and with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* #2, #5, #6, and #9.