



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING
Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Deborah A. Carpenter, AICP, Division Director
Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

October 2, 2024

Address: 12602 Catoctin Furnace Rd., Thurmont **Meeting Date:** October 2, 2024
Applicant: Catoctin Furnace Historical Society **Report Date:** April 15, 2024
Case No.: COA 24-09 **Staff:** Beau Lockard
Request: Construct an addition to the west elevation of the Hoke House.

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Hoke House property was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 22-08) on May 16, 2023. The property includes the entire parcel, which includes the historic house. The house was built circa 1820 as worker housing and is associated with the John Brien expansion of Catoctin Furnace. The property is a contributing resource to the Catoctin Furnace Historic District (MIHP #F-6-45), a National Register District. The period of significance is circa 1820 to 1903. The property is accessed from Catoctin Furnace Rd.

These are the previous completed applications for Certificates of Approval (COA) filed for this property:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
COA #23-04	09/06/2023	Catoctin Furnace Historical Society	Approved
To remove the non-contributing kitchen addition on the south elevation and remove all non-historic siding			
A-COA #24-10	08/29/2024	Catoctin Furnace Historical Society	Approved
Installation of half-rounded gutters and rounded downspouts			
COA #24-08	10/02/2024	Catoctin Furnace Historical Society	In-Progress
Replace asphalt shingle roof with metal standing seam roof and reconstruct chimney stack on south elevation.			



Image 1: Subject Property

REQUEST

A Certificate of Approval is requested to construct an addition to the west (rear) elevation of the Hoke House.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and

- its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or of a structure within a historic district, and its appurtenances and environmental setting, and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
 - (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
 - (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a chapter on Additions and New Construction (Chapter 7) that should primarily be referred to when reviewing this COA application. For this case, please refer to Chapter 7, Section A. "Additions" and Section D "Form and Features." Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Staff Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF EVALUATION

The applicant is requesting to build a rear wing addition with a shed roof to accommodate a bathroom and kitchen. The historic house does not have modern plumbing. The addition would house all modern utilities, keeping them out of the historic log structure. The previous non-contributing gabled roof additions on the south and west elevations of the structure were removed through a previous COA (#23-04). This proposed new addition will have a much lower impact on the historic context of the house, while still allowing the property to be permitted for residence. The addition will also include a small rear porch with exterior access to the addition.

The design for the addition is based on other early 20th century rear shed roof additions made to other tenement houses in Catoctin Furnace Village. The applicant has also previously completed a similar addition project to the rear (east) elevation of Forgerman's House, CR# 22-01, with approval from the Maryland Historical Trust easement program, prior to the Forgerman House's nomination to the County Register of Historic Places.

Staff analysis of the *Guidelines* for this project is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
7A: Additions	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, "Additions shall not compromise the historic character of an existing building, its site, or its neighborhood; character-defining features of the existing building shall be retained." The proposed plans show that no historic material will be removed during the construction of the proposed addition. The addition is not covering up any identified character-defining features on the west elevation. Neighborhood compatibility is discussed below.
7A: Additions	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, "Additions should be located on rear or secondary building elevations and out of view from a public right-of-way." The addition will be located on the west (rear) elevation, which is not visible from the public right-of-way, Catoctin Furnace Road. The drawing on Sheet A-2 of the Front Elevation shows that the addition will not be visible from that elevation.

7A: Additions	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “The design of building additions shall be compatible and sympathetic to the character of the existing building in massing, form, scale, detailing, and materiality.” The proposed design of the addition is based on other early 20 th century shed roof additions in the village, making it compatible to the character of the surrounding neighborhood/village.
7A: Additions	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “The addition should be distinguishable from the historic building and not imitate historic features. Additions should appear subordinate to the main building and not overpower it. The elements and features of an addition should be scaled proportionately to the overall building.” The proposed design of the addition shows that it will be distinguishable from the historic core of the house and will be scaled to be subordinate to the historic tenant housing on the site.
7D: Form and Features	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “Window and door openings, porches, roof elements, and other features of new buildings should be scaled appropriately and create a similar order and rhythm to the historic buildings found nearby.” The proposed standing seam metal shed roof, six-over-six double hung windows, and other elements of the addition are compatible with the historic house and the surround historic properties within Catoctin Furnace.
4F4: Porches: Alterations	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “Porches shall not be added to primary facades or those visible from the public right-of-way if pictorial or documentary evidence does not indicate their previous existence.” The proposed addition includes a new small porch on the west elevation of the addition. This porch is not visible from the right-of-way, is on the rear (west) elevation of the historic property, and is attached to the new addition, not the historic house.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Commission **approve** COA #24-09 as this project is compatible in character to the remainder of the structure and to the surrounding area; does not seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures; and is compatible in character to the property and consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #9 and #10*.