



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

Deborah A. Carpenter, AICP, Division Director

Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

| | | | |
|-------------------------|---|----------------------|-------------------|
| Address: | 4208 Lime Kiln Road | Meeting Date: | December 4, 2024 |
| Applicant/Owner: | Bonnie Miller | Report Date: | November 19, 2024 |
| Case No.: | HPC24-1201DR | Staff: | Amanda Whitmore |
| Proposal: | Request for Review and Recommendation: Demolition Permit for Lime Kiln Methodist Church | | |

BACKGROUND

In accordance with amended §1-23-8 of the Frederick County Code, the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) will review an application for demolition if Historic Preservation staff have determined that the property is 50 years old or older and has historical, cultural, architectural, or archaeological significance per §1-23-6(B). A demolition permit application for the Lime Kiln Methodist Church was received on October 28, 2024.

SITE ANALYSIS

The Lime Kiln Methodist Church is located in a small former industrial community known as Lime Kiln, located between Buckeystown and Frederick City, off of Buckeystown Pike. The church is located on an approximately 0.29-acre lot. The property is identified on the Maryland Inventory of Historic Properties (MIHP) as the Lime Kiln Methodist Church under MIHP F-1-98 and is also located in the Lime Kiln Survey District under MIHP F-1-186. The Lime Kiln Survey District was determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under criterion A, history, and criterion C, architecture. The property includes the historic church.

Lime Kiln is an early industrial community centered on a single industry, lime quarrying and burning. The Grove Lime Company was established circa 1858 and expanded into a large-scale commercial operation. Because of the kiln's success and expanded operation, a worker community was established and expanded. By the late 19th century, the town included the lime kilns, frame shop buildings, a church, a post office, a toll house, and worker housing for both the kilns and the Baltimore and Ohio railroad.



Location of Lime Kiln Methodist Church, outlined in yellow.

The church is a one-story, gabled frame building with an extended belfry on the northeast elevation. The main entrance is located on the first level of the extended belfry tower. Twin three-panel doors with decorative molding and a triangular transom provide access to the interior. A window opening, that is boarded over, is located on the southeast and northwest sides of the tower on the first level. Gothic window openings on the second floor of the tower are visible on all three sides. An open belfry with decorative sawn work and railing is located on top of the tower. The tower is covered in a pyramidal roof with slate tile and a finial. The exterior walls are covered in German siding with corner boards. Three Gothic window openings are located on the northeast and southwest elevations, respectively. The gabled roof is covered in asphalt shingles. The church was built in 1888.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Staff has determined that the property is at least 50 years old and is not designated to the Frederick County Register of Historic Places. Therefore, per Section 1-23-8 of the updated Historic Preservation Ordinance, Historic Preservation staff must determine if the property has significance based on the criteria of Section 1-23-6(B).

The following criteria are used to assist in evaluating the significance of a property. A property needs to be determined to be significant in one or more of the following criteria:

- a) The property has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the county, state, or nation.

Yes, the property, as the only religious structure in the Lime Kiln community, contributes to the development and heritage of the area.

- b) The property is the site of an historic event.

No significant event was found to have taken place on this property.

- c) The property is identified with a person or group of persons who influenced society.

No information was identified that shows the property is associated with a person or group of persons that influenced society.

- d) The property exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, political, or historic heritage of the county and its communities.

No, the property does not exemplify any of these developments.

- e) The property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, design style, or method of construction of landscape architecture, engineering, public art, or architecture.

Yes, the property embodies characteristics of a typical rural late 19th century church with the simple one-story structure and extended belfry tower. The Gothic windows and German siding also contribute to the characteristics significant to this type of architecture.

- f) The property represents the work of a master craftsman, architect, landscape architect, engineer, artist, or builder.

No, the property does not represent the work of a master architect, craftsman, landscape architect, engineer, artist, or builder.

- g) The property possesses significant artistic value.

No, the property does not possess artistic value.

- h) The property represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

No, the property does not represent a distinguishable entity that lacks individual distinction.

- i) The property represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or county, due to its singular physical characteristics, landscape, or historical event.

Yes, the property has stood in its location for over 100 years as the only religious structure in the small industrial community and the belfry tower serves as a familiar visual within the streetscape.

- j) The property is a rare example of a particular period, style, material, or construction technique.

No, the property is not a rare example of a period, style, material or construction technique.

Historic Preservation staff find the property meets three of the significance criteria; therefore, the Historic Preservation Commission must determine if the property is of unusual historic value to Frederick County, the State, or the nation. The updated Historic Preservation Ordinance defines unusual historic value as, *a property eligible for designation under this chapter with the added requirement that the property represents an outstanding or exceptional aspect of federal, state, or local history, culture, architecture, or archaeology that is not otherwise represented within the Frederick County Register of Historic Places, the loss of which would cause irreparable harm to the public interest as stated in § 1-23-2 of this chapter.*

If the Commission does not consider the property to be of unusual historic value, the demolition permit may proceed. However, if the Commission determines that the property does have unusual historic value, the Commission shall attempt to formulate an economically feasible plan with the owner for the preservation of the structure.

Although the property meets three criteria of significance, the property does not meet the definition of a property with unusual historic value. Staff does not find it to be an outstanding or exceptional aspect of local history. Additionally, several church structures are already designated to the Frederick County Register of Historic Places. The Buckeystown United Methodist Church #80, designated July 2024 to the County Register, is a very close representation of the architecture present in the Lime Kiln Methodist Church.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends against recognizing the Lime Kiln Methodist Church as a property with unusual historic value in Frederick County. If the Commission agrees, Staff would suggest that the property owner consider salvaging any historic materials or features in good condition that may be reused in other historic churches such as the Buckeystown United Methodist Church #80.