



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING

Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

Deborah A. Carpenter, AICP, Division Director
Kimberly Gaines, Director

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

May 7, 2025

Address: 6509 Green Valley Rd., New Market

Meeting Date: May 7, 2025

Applicant: Audu Besmer and Naomi Walcott

Report Date: April 24, 2025

Case No.: COA 25-01

Staff: Amanda Whitmore

Request: Repair windows and install storm windows

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Oliver P. Harding farm was added to the Peace & Plenty Rural Historic District on January 7, 2025. The district was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 20-04) on April 4, 2023. The property includes the entire parcel which includes the historic house, smoke house, and spring house. The property was built between circa 1780-1790 with major interior alterations in the late 1820s or early 1830s. The two stone outbuildings are also about the same date as the house. Improvements were made to the house in 1970 and again in 2017 when the rear addition was removed and replaced with a larger two-story addition. There have been no previous applications for Certificates of Approvals (COA) filed for this property.



Subject property.

Frederick County: Rich History, Bright Future

30 North Market Street, Frederick, MD 21701 • 301-600-1138 • Fax 301-600-1645

www.FrederickCountyMD.gov

REQUEST

A Certificate of Approval is requested to repair four nine-over-six window sashes, repair seven six-over-six sashes, and install historic one-lite storm windows. The historic sashes and original panes will be retained. Repairs to broken areas of the sash will be completed to match the original. Additionally, glass panes will need to be replaced for several of the windows. All of the windows will be scraped and painted.



APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Peace and Plenty Rural Historic District Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archaeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.

- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archaeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archaeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archaeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Peace and Plenty Rural Historic District Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Changes to Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

STAFF EVALUATION

The applicant proposes the removal and repair of several windows on the farmhouse and repair some broken areas of sashes. Additionally, the applicant proposes replacing broken or missing windowpanes in several windows using antique glass. The windows will be weather stripped, rehung, and painted. Storm windows will also be installed on all the windows on the house.

Staff analysis of this project against the *Guidelines* is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4C3: Window Repair or Replacement	Yes	<p>The <i>Guidelines</i> state every effort should be made to repair deteriorated historic windows rather than replace them. The applicant proposes to repair several sashes and frames using epoxy, wood patch, or lap joints to stabilize them.</p> <p>Additionally, the <i>Guidelines</i> state that only clear glass should be used for window replacement unless documentary or physical evidence indicates another type of glass existed. The applicant proposes to replace missing or damaged window glass with clear glass.</p>
4C7: Weatherization	Yes	<p>The <i>Guidelines</i> state that window repair work should be undertaken prior to weatherization and that weatherstripping and caulking can be used around the window frame, window sash, and door to reduce air infiltration. The <i>Guidelines</i> further state that appropriate contemporary materials are acceptable for weatherstripping and caulking, so long as they are compatible with the historic window, door, and wall materials. The applicant proposes to repair the windows prior to weatherstripping.</p>
4C7: Storm Windows	Yes	<p>The <i>Guidelines</i> state that storm windows can be installed on the exterior or interior of historic windows. If installed on the exterior side, storm window frames should match the color of the existing exterior trim and the configuration of the historic window should be clearly visible through the storm window. The stiles and rails cannot be wider than the window to be covered and the meeting rails must match. The applicant proposes to install storms on the exterior and the historic window will be clearly visible through the storm window and the meeting rails will match.</p>

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Commission **conditionally approve** COA #25-01 under the criteria for Application Review in Chapter 1-23-7(B) (1) with the following condition:

- The stiles and rails of the storm windows are narrower than the windows.

With this added condition it can be found that the proposal: will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource; is compatible in character to the remainder of the structure and to the surrounding area; does not seriously impair the historic, archaeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures; and is compatible in character to the property and with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #5 and #6*.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTION

Madam Chair, I have studied the application and all other relevant documents and presentations related to this case and I am familiar with the property in question. I find that if constructed in accordance with the application materials submitted, the project will be compatible with the character of the historic property.

I move to approve COA # 25-01 for 6509 Green Valley Road with the condition the stiles and rails of the storm windows are narrower than the windows. With this condition, the application meets the following criteria:

1. The proposed change meets section 4.C Changes to Building Exteriors: Openings of the Peace and Plenty Rural Historic District design guidelines.
2. The proposed changes are compatible with the character of the historic property and do not impair the historic or architectural significance of the property.