



FREDERICK COUNTY GOVERNMENT

Jessica Fitzwater
County Executive

DIVISION OF PLANNING & PERMITTING *Deborah A. Carpenter, AICP, Division Director*
Livable Frederick Planning & Design Office *Kimberly Gaines, Director*

FREDERICK COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

July 22, 2025

Address: 1606 Gapland Road, Jefferson

Meeting Date: August 6, 2025

Applicant: Burkittsville Preservation Association

Report Date: July 22, 2025

Case No.: COA 25-02

Staff: Beau Lockard

Request: Change of material on the roof of the meat dryhouse from damaged metal to hand-cut wood shingle

PROPERTY BACKGROUND

The Hamilton Willard Shafer farm was designated to the County Register of Historic Properties (CR # 21-07) on July 5, 2022. The property is the entire parcel which includes the historic house, bank barn, dryhouse, workshop, well, and wagon shed. The property was built between 1820 and 1830 with an addition added to the house circa 1910.

Previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
A-COA #22-07	09/14/2022	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
In-kind replacement of rotten studs and sills on the summer kitchen			
COA #22-11	10/18/2022	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
Repair and/or replacement of the windows and shutters of the farmhouse			
COA #23-01	01/13/2023	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
Remove the non-contributing wall on the east elevation 1910 addition			
A-COA #23-03	03/06/2023	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
In-kind replacement of rotten back porch decking and joists			

Frederick County: Rich History, Bright Future

30 North Market Street, Frederick, MD 21701 • 301-600-1138 • Fax 301-600-1645

www.FrederickCountyMD.gov

A-COA #23-07	05/24/2023	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
In-kind replacement of rotten front porch decking, ceiling, and joists			
COA #24-07	09/04/2024	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
Rebuilt front porch columns			
A-COA #25-08	04/28/2025	Burkittsville Preservation Association	Approved
In-kind replacement of the rear porch decking, ceiling, and joists			



Fig. 1: Subject property

REQUEST

The applicant is requested to change the roofing material of the dryhouse by replacing the damaged metal roof with hand-cut wood shingles.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations to a designated County Register property several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the *Frederick County Historic Preservation Code: Chapter 1-23*, the *Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines (Guidelines)*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Frederick County Code: Chapter 1-23-7B

- (1) In reviewing applications, the Commission shall give consideration to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the landmark, site, or structure and its relationship to the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of the surrounding area; the relationship of the exterior architectural features of a landmark or structure to the remainder of the landmark or structure and to the surrounding area; the general compatibility of proposed exterior design, scale, proportion, arrangement, texture, and materials to the landmark, site, or structure and to the surrounding area; and any other factors including aesthetic factors which the Commission deems to be pertinent.
- (2) The Commission shall consider only exterior features of a landmark or structure and shall not consider any interior arrangements.
- (3) The Commission shall not disapprove an application except with respect to the several factors specified in paragraph (1) above.
- (4) The Commission shall be strict in its judgment of plans for sites or structures determined by research to be of historic, archeological, or architectural significance. The Commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for sites or structures of little historic, archeological, or architectural significance, or of plans involving new construction, unless in the Commission's judgment such plans would seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures. The Commission is not required to limit construction, reconstruction, or alteration to the architectural style of any one (1) period.

Frederick County Register of Historic Places Design Guidelines

The *Guidelines* contain a Building Exteriors Chapter (Chapter 4) that should be referred to when reviewing this COA application. For this case, please refer to Chapter 4, Section B, Subheading 4: "In cases where...the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission." Further analysis of how this request meets the *Guidelines* is provided in the Evaluation section below.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The *Standards* define rehabilitation as "the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values." The *Standards* that are most applicable to the application before the Commission are as follows:

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

STAFF EVALUATION

Over the past year wind storms have damaged the roof of the dryhouse, at one point lifting the roof off the structure. This has rapidly increased the deterioration of the stone structure. As part of the project for the in-kind reconstruction of the stone walls of the structure, the applicant, Burkittsville Preservation Association (BPA), is proposing to replace the damaged metal roof of the meat drying outbuilding with hand-cut wood shingles. The sub-roof structure will also be reconstructed with rough sawn lumber. This project is consistent with the BPA mission to restore the Hamilton Shafer Farm to the property's period of significance (1820s to 1910).

While stone dryhouses are rare, they are more common in early German immigrant farms, particularly in neighboring Pennsylvania. Small food processing structures, such as dryhouses and smokehouses, originally had wood shingle roofs due to the relative ease and abundance of the shingle material, especially when compared to metal roofing for a small structure in the 19th century.

Staff analysis of this project against the *Guidelines* is as follows:

Guideline	Met?	Comments
4B3: Roofs: Roofing Materials, Wood Shingles and Metal Roofing	Mostly	The <i>Guidelines</i> state wood shingles should only be added to a building or structure as a replacement material if there is pictorial, historical, or architectural evidence that wood shingles were once in use. Dryhouses, similar to smokehouses, historically were covered with wood

		shingles. There is no pictorial evidence to indicate if wood shingles were once in use on this structure, though that is not unusual given the age and location of the structure.
4B4: Roofs: Roof Maintenance, Repair, and Replacement	Yes	The <i>Guidelines</i> state, “In cases where the original material is no longer available, or the existing material is not original, alternative materials will be carefully considered by the Commission.” Since the current material is not original and a wood shingle roof was likely used during the period of significance, the Commission should consider changing the current damaged metal roofing material to hand-cut wood shingles to better match the building’s historic character and form. The proposed roof would also provide protection of the historic structure that the current roof is damaging.
4B4: Roofs: Roof Maintenance, Repair, and Replacement	Mostly	The <i>Guidelines</i> state that “If historic roofing cannot be repaired and replacement is necessary, replace the historic roofing with materials that match the existing roofing in-kind, whenever possible.” While the roofing exterior is changing, the roofing substrate will be replaced with rough sawn lumber in a manner similar to the current construction with additional support to protect against future weather (particularly wind) events.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Commission **approve** COA #25-02 as this project is compatible in character with the remainder of the structure and the surrounding area; does not seriously impair the historic, archeological, or architectural significance of surrounding sites or structures; and is compatible in character to the property and consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* #6.