TITLE: Saint Paul Lutheran Church

FILE NUMBER: SP 14-01, AP# 14292, APFO# 14294, FRO# 14295, SWM# 14293

REQUEST: Concept Site Development Plan Approval

The Applicant is requesting Concept Site Development Plan approval a 2,856 s.f. addition to the existing church structure and a 4,900 s.f. addition to the existing parish house for a new social hall (total: 5,900 s.f.) located on a combined 1.27-acre site.

PROJECT INFORMATION:
ADDRESS/LOCATION: Located on the north side of Jefferson Pike (MD 180) approximately 1,000 feet east of Old Middletown Road in Jefferson

TAX MAP/PARCEL: TM 87A; Parcel 156 & 157 (Addition Plat pending)

COMP. PLAN: Village Center

ZONING: Village Center

PLANNING REGION: Brunswick

WATER/SEWER: W-5; S-1

APPLICANT/REPRESENTATIVES:
APPLICANT: Saint Paul Lutheran Church

OWNER: - same -

ENGINEER: Terra Solutions Engineering, LLC

ARCHITECT: Proffitt & Associates Architects

ATTORNEY: N/A

STAFF: Denis Superczynski

RECOMMENDATION: Conditional Approval

ATTACHMENTS:
EXHIBIT 1- Revised Concept Site Plan
EXHIBIT 2- Revised Site Renderings
EXHIBIT 3 – Architect’s Revised Building Area Tabulation (June 30, 2014)
STAFF REPORT

Development Request
The Applicant is requesting Concept Site Development Plan approval for several improvements to the site and existing buildings of the Saint Paul Lutheran Church property. The proposed improvements are phased and include:

- Phase 1 - Addition of 112 s.f. elevator to the east side of the church sanctuary structure
- Phase 2 – Addition of 171 s.f. stairwell to the east side of the church sanctuary structure
- Phase 3 – Two-story, 2,715 s.f.(footprint) office/classroom addition to east side of church sanctuary structure (subsumes Phase 1 addition); includes combining and re-design of two existing vehicular entrances into one single entrance onto Jefferson Pike and associated internal driveway, circulation, and landscaping improvements.
- Phase 4 – Construction of new social hall (total approx. 5,900 s.f. footprint) incorporating portion of existing historic parish house

The primary use is being reviewed as a Place of worship (and permitted accessory uses) under the heading of Institutional per §1-19-5.310 Use Table in the Zoning Ordinance. The parish house is currently used for classrooms and daycare and is considered an accessory use to the place of worship. All uses are principal and accessory permitted uses in the VC Zoning District subject to Site Development Plan approval. Further details regarding these uses may be provided as part of the Site Development Plan application.

As required by Zoning Ordinance §1-19-7.500(D), Site Development Plan proposals in the VC Zoning District are required to submit plans to the Planning Commission (or its representative) for Concept Site Development Plan Approval. This Concept Site Development Plan must demonstrate how the proposed activity will meet development standards listed in §1-19-7.500(C).

BACKGROUND

Development History
The church building and parish house are existing historic structures that have been determined to be contributing resources in the Jefferson Survey (Historic) District. The District itself was determined to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places in 2004 by the Maryland Historical Trust as an outstanding example of a typical ‘turnpike town’. Jefferson was originally established in 1774 as New Town along the turnpike connecting the City of Frederick with Harpers Ferry. The church sanctuary was constructed in 1866 replacing a previous structure from the 1840’s. The parish house was constructed ca. 1840 and remains an excellent example of the Greek Revival style in the village.
The Applicant filed an Addition Plat to combine the two parcels that are the subject of the Concept Site Development Plan (Addition Plat # M3113; AP 14296). The church lot (Parcel 156, 0.462 acres) and the parish house lot (Parcel 157, 0.867 acres) would form a combined lot of 1.274 acres after accounting for the SHA right-of-way dedication along Jefferson Pike. The parcels are in common ownership and the Addition Plat should be approved and recorded prior to an anticipated filing of the Site Development Plan.

**Existing Site Characteristics**

The Site is currently occupied by two primary structures including the church sanctuary (3864 Jefferson Pike, on Parcel 156) and the church parish house (3866 Jefferson Pike, on Parcel 157). The parish house is used for classroom and daycare space. An existing garage building is located to the rear of the parish house but is planned for removal in Phase 3 or Phase 4 of the project. The Site is currently served by three separate vehicular access drives onto Jefferson Pike. The western driveway hugs the boundary between the church sanctuary and an adjoining residence and is used only for exiting the site. A central, entrance-only driveway between the church and parsonage, and an eastern driveway serving the parsonage provide access from Jefferson Pike. The cemetery access road connects with Old Middletown Road approximately 1,000 feet west and north of the church property.

Existing parking provides approximately 26 marked spaces and perhaps 6-10 unmarked spaces located in the gravel lot at the rear of the parsonage. The gravel lot is located predominantly on an adjacent parcel that is not included in this Concept Site Development Plan.
The Site is surrounded by a variety of existing land uses. The Site is bordered on the west by a single-family residence and a bank. East of the church property single-family detached homes predominate. North of the church are three cemetery properties, at least one of which is associated with the Applicant. A small portion of burial ground is located on Parcel 156 north of the church’s small rear parking lot and is included in the Concept Site Plan area. Land uses across Jefferson Pike to the south of the Site are predominantly residential with an existing multi-family use directly across the street.

The site is served by public sewer and a private, on-site well located on the far northern edge of the property.
ANALYSIS
Summary of Development Standards Findings and Conclusions

Form and Layout
The plan for proposed changes to the Saint Paul Lutheran Church site anticipates the expansion of both the church and the parish house along with revisions to the access driveways and parking.

Church Expansion Phases
Phase 1 – addition of an elevator, which will have a footprint of 112 s.f. and will be located at about the midpoint along the eastern side of the church.

Phase 2 – addition of a stairwell, which will have a footprint of 171 s.f. to be located at the rear corner of the church.

Phase 3 – two (2) story addition to the church for office and classroom space with a total floor area of 2,715 s.f. This addition will envelop the elevator addition.

The relative scale of each of Phases 1 through 3 is in flux as the architect continues to work through the design process for the church additions. However, the ultimate building footprint remains at approximately 7,750 s.f. (see Exhibit 3, Building Area Tabulation).
As seen from the street, the most obvious physical change to the Site will occur at Phase 3 when the congregation constructs a 2-story addition to the historic church sanctuary. The additions of Phases 1 and 2 – the elevator and stairwell additions - will be apparent, but not as obvious as the expansion of the street front of the sanctuary at Phase 3. The office/classroom expansion will double the Jefferson Pike façade of the structure and constrict views northward into the site. Architecturally, this addition will face the interior court and driveway roundabout, while turning its side to the street. The architect is proposing the use of tall windows similar to those of the existing church building. The slight stepping back of this new addition will offset the effect of a continuous street wall as will the use of traditional architectural features on the new structure.

Parish House Expansion
Phase 4 – Replacement/expansion of the parish house structure to be used as a new social hall with a total floor area of approximately 5,900 s.f. (including some of the existing footprint of the parish house). The creation of a new social hall, utilizing a prominent portion of the ca. 1840 parish house, will allow the congregation to expand its allowable associated uses on the existing site and give new use to an historic structure that might otherwise be razed. The existing front portion of the parish hall is proposed to be integrated into the social hall structure. The visual impact of the massing of this new structure will be most noticeable to the residential neighbor on the east, though the new structure will be set back more than 100 feet from Jefferson Pike and will not appreciably alter significant views from the area surrounding the house itself. Additionally, at 5,900 s.f. in size, the new social hall will not differ significantly from nearby non-residential commercial and institutional structures in Jefferson.

Access and Parking
The proposed centralized driveway – to be constructed similar to a roundabout – will be located in what is now a front lawn of the parish house and will consolidate two existing driveways. This new internal
drive configuration would provide a loop pattern of vehicular circulation around the social hall and simplify movements onto and from Jefferson Pike. The western driveway would remain in place and continue to serve as an exit only to Jefferson Pike. The secondary access at the rear of the site, which ultimately connects to Old Middletown Rd., will be maintained. All proposed on-site parking has been located to the side or rear of buildings. The specific parking space numbers, dimensions and circulation will be reviewed at the Site Development Plan application. The concept plan proposes 44 spaces, which is 8 spaces short of the required 52 spaces. However, the proposed parking plan represents a clear improvement over the existing conditions on the site. To supplement the on-site parking the church is proposing an off-site parking agreement with the bank located 150 feet west of the church. A typical walk from the bank parking area to the front door of the church sanctuary building would be less than 200 feet in length. The distance to the proposed front door of the social hall would average 450 feet. There are at least 25 parking spaces available on the bank site and the Applicant will provide details regarding its usage at the time of Site Development Plan application. There is also some on-street parking available along Jefferson Pike.

The State Highway Administration is currently developing a streetscape improvement project for this section of Jefferson Pike (within Jefferson) that will look at on-street parking issues, stormwater management, sidewalks and curb/gutter. This project is currently in the planning stage so there are no specific plans or designs at this time.

The Addition Plat being finalized to combine parcels 156 and 157 requires the dedication/reservation of a 35 ft. wide section of frontage (as measured from the existing road centerline) which results in a roughly 13 ft. wide section of land (measured roughly from the centerline of the existing sidewalk) along the entire frontage of the church property being available for SHA improvements. No elements of the proposed Concept Site Development Plan appear to interfere with expected SHA improvements being considered as part of the streetscape project.
Development Density
Non-residential density in the VC district is not limited explicitly other than by practical site, circulation, design, dimensional regulations, and infrastructure constraints.

Public Facilities
Public sewer service currently serves the site and is intended to be utilized to serve the expanded structures as well. At such time as public water is available to the site, the private well would be abandoned in compliance with Health Department regulations. The site is currently classified S-1/W-5 in the County’s Water and Sewer Plan.

Detailed Analysis of Development Standards

Concept Plan Approval for VC projects is required as provided in §1-19-7.500(D) Procedures – concept of the Frederick County Zoning Ordinance.

Site Development §1-19-7.500 (D): Development requiring site development plan review, as provided in §1-19-5.310 Use Table, shall receive concept plan approval from the Planning Commission or its authorized representative as the first step in the development review process. The concept plan, submitted in conformance with §1-19-3.301.2 (B) shall demonstrate:

(a) The manner in which the standards within this section have been met by the proposed development; and,

(b) The manner in which the proposed development conforms to adopted county community or corridor plans for the area where the development is proposed.

- Conformity with Community or Corridor Plan –
  - No county community or corridor plan has been adopted for the Jefferson Pike corridor or village area. Generally, the proposal demonstrates adherence to the general principles for compact development outlined in the County’s Comprehensive Plan through seeking the expansion of a mix and intensity of uses conducive to the continuing development of compact neighborhoods in areas generally served by public infrastructure and facilities.

- Storage and Operations/Refuse and Recycling/Signage –
  - Institutional activity – primarily some of the accessory uses associated with a place of worship - proposed for the Site must demonstrate detailed compliance with this item at the time of Site Plan review. The Concept Plan as submitted does not preclude compliance with the Code and generally meets expectations for approval at the time of Site Plan Review. Staff will continue to work with the Applicant through Site Development Plan Review process regarding building design and function to reduce or eliminate impacts on the nearby residential development.

- Site Development and Layout –
  - Every effort has been made by the Applicant to ensure that the expanded buildings face the public ways and primary internal, semi-public spaces. Pedestrian facilities in this concept plan are accommodated to the extent possible on a constricted site while maintaining practical access for vehicles across the property. Staff will address pedestrian movement onto and across the property in greater detail at Site Development Plan application to ensure that there are safe and convenient pathways for visitors moving through the property from any of the parking areas provided.
  - Maintenance of the primary historic structures on the property goes a long way toward maintaining the integrity of the Jefferson Survey (Historic) District. Integration of the parish house into the Phase 4 development of the social hall is critical in maintaining the architectural connection to Jefferson’s past. Staff recommends as a condition of this Saint Paul Lutheran Church – Concept Site Development Plan
Concept Site Development Plan approval, that the façade and a small portion of the parish house building be preserved and integrated into the design of the new social hall.

- As the expanded structures move through the development review process in the future, the visual screening of undesired views of any service areas and activities will need to be carefully thought out and resolved at the time of Site Plan review.

- The proposed Concept Plan adequately differentiates between areas of pedestrian access and areas of vehicular movement. However, there is no real direct connection from the sidewalk on Jefferson Pike to the front entrance to the social hall. It is likely that this can be resolved at Site Development Plan application.

- The opportunity for off-site parking is important for the development of the Site, in particular, the creation of the new social hall. The Applicant will need to demonstrate strategies for handling peak parking demand during events in the new structure utilizing a combination of nearby off-site spaces as well as a handful of on-street parking spaces likely to remain after the construction of SHA’s streetscape improvements.

- The proposed development has been designed around an internal driveway network that is interconnected and facilitates efficient movement through and within the Site. The Applicant has proposed one full movement driveway onto Jefferson Pike to occur in conjunction with the development of the Phase 3 project elements and one partial access point from the Site that support efficient traffic movement while not disrupting vehicle flow on public roadways. The secondary access to the site via Old Middletown Road and the cemetery lane is proposed to remain.

- The layout allows for both vehicular and pedestrian interconnections between the various uses on the property as well as the surrounding neighborhood (where existing).

**Building Massing and Bulk**

- Village Center Footprint Thresholds §1-19-7.500(C)(4)(d)

  Since Jefferson is a growth area the following building footprint thresholds for non-residential uses would apply:

  - Base Footprint Allowance – 5,000 sq ft. within a community growth area.
  - Interim Footprint Allowance – 8,000 sq.ft. w/ planning commission approval
  - Maximum Footprint Allowed – 10,000 sq. ft. subject to additional criteria w/ planning commission approval

  - Existing Church – 4,866 s.f.
  - Phase 1 Footprint – 4,978 s.f. (with elevator addition)
  - Phase 2 Footprint – 5,149 s.f. (with elevator and stairwell additions)
  - Phase 3 Footprint – 7,752 s.f. (with stairwell addition and classroom addition but minus the elevator addition)

  **Church Building - Final Proposed Footprint:** 7,752 s.f.

  - Existing Parish House Structure – 2,750 s.f.
  - Demolished portion of Parish House – approx. 1,823 s.f.
  - Addition to Parish House – approx. 4,960 s.f.

  **Social Hall – Final Proposed Footprint:** 5,900 s.f.

- All of the buildings in this project are oriented to show their access/entry features to the public or private internal drive or court. The concept plan maintains human-scaled architectural elements as illustrated in the conceptual architectural elevations for the renovations.

- Although specifics regarding materials and finishes will be determined at the time of Site Plan review, the visualization material typically submitted for the Concept Plan generally provides information related to building shape, height, massing and window and door
placement. The Applicant has submitted elevations and a limited rendering of the expanded sanctuary structure itself. Staff has been working with the Applicant to ensure building design and finishes that are internally cohesive and respectful of the historic structures existing on the Site.

- **Dimensional Regulations (Height and Setbacks)** –
  Per §1-19-7.500(B)(3) the VC district provides for the establishment of dimensional standards on a site-by-site basis, using adjoining and facing buildings as a guide. Given the unusual nature and layout of this project, the setbacks as illustrated appear to be in keeping with the spirit of the VC district and will not encroach into the actual or perceived public realm.

**Findings/Conclusions**
Based upon the review and analysis as provided above, Staff finds that the Concept Site Development Plan generally meets the intent of the Development Standards within the VC zoning district. Staff will continue to work with the Applicant as the project moves through the final site development plan process to address all outstanding items as discussed within the Staff Report. Staff anticipates that the application will meet the site plan review criteria as set forth in §1-19-3.300.4 including items related to site development, transportation, parking, public utilities, natural features, and common areas.

**Other Applicable Regulations**

**Forest Resource – Chapter 1-21:**
Concept Plan review triggers the submission of a Forest Stand Delineation (as required per section 1-21-31 of the Frederick County Code). Through the Forest Resource review process, areas for reforestation, afforestation and priority areas for conservation are identified, including retention of specimen trees (trees over 30 inches in diameter at breast height (dbh)).

This development is subject to FRO. A Combined Preliminary/Final FRO plan has been submitted and is approved. No forest removal is proposed. The required 0.20 acre afforestation requirement will be provided via payment of fee-in-lieu or purchase of forest banking credits. This FRO mitigation must be provided prior to applying for grading or building permits, whichever is applied for first.

**Historic Preservation – Chapter 1-23:**
Since the Applicant is not seeking federal or state tax credits, and is not in need of any special zoning consideration available through historic designations, the sole historic preservation issue is the need for the Applicant to address the Village Center design standards as they relate to the expansion of the two historic buildings on the Site. As previously mentioned, the two primary structures that are the subject of this Concept Site Development Plan have been identified as contributing resources within the Jefferson Survey (Historic) District and the review of any development plans for this Site will proceed with this knowledge. Prior to the commencement of Phase 4, the Applicant should be required to complete a documentation of the parish house to establish its condition and architectural heritage prior to the selective demolition of the rear portions of the building. Details of such documentation may be addressed at Site Development Plan approval.

**Findings/Conclusions**
The Applicant is required to address these other applicable regulations as part of the Site Development Plan approval process moving forward after this Concept Site Development Plan has been approved.
RECOMMENDATION
Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve this Concept Site Development Plan, including conceptual approvals of the expanded building footprints for both the church and the proposed social hall above 5,000 s.f. but not to exceed 8,000 s.f. with the following conditions to be addressed at Site Development Plan application.

1) Applicant will work with Staff to finalize the preliminary design of the social hall and church sanctuary buildings to best protect the historic integrity of the structures and the Jefferson Survey (Historic) District.

2) Remove the portion of Site Plan Note #1 stating “…when the parsonage can be removed.” and stipulate that a partial preservation of at least the south façade and some reasonable building depth be maintained in the approved design for the social hall.

3) The Applicant shall refine the design of pedestrian paths on the Site to allow pedestrians to move safely and easily between the primary structures and the parking areas (on- and off-site) and public sidewalks.

4) No Site Development Plan which is based on this approved Concept Site Development Plan for the Saint Paul Lutheran Church may be approved by the Planning Commission until such time as there is an approved Addition Plat combining the two parcels (156 and 157) and accommodating the SHA right-of-way dedication/reservation.

6) At the time of Site Development Plan application, the Applicant must address landscape requirements for screening parking areas, providing tree canopy shading of paved surfaces, and providing street trees appropriate to the Site given its historic significance and location along Jefferson’s main street corridor.

PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION

MOTION TO APPROVE
I move that the Planning Commission APPROVE Concept Site Development Plan #SP14-01 (AP-14292, APFO 14294, FRO 14295, SWM 14293) for the proposed Saint Paul Lutheran Church including conceptual approval of increased building footprints for the church and social hall above 5,000 s.f. but no greater than 8,000 s.f., with conditions as specified in the Staff Report.
Phase 1: Elevator Addition

Saint Paul Lutheran Church – Concept Site Development Plan
July 9, 2014
Page 13 of 17
Phase 2: ADA Restrooms

[Diagram of floor plans]

Phase 2: ADA Restrooms

[Diagram of elevation views]
Building Area Tabulation for
St. Paul Lutheran Church
Jefferson, MD
30 June 2014

Worship Facility: (footprint only)
Existing = 4,852.02 sf
Phase 1 = 451.56 sf
Subtotal (Exist. + Ph1) = 5303.58 sf
Phase 2 = 162.00 sf
Subtotal (Exist. + Ph1 + Ph2) = 5442.54 sf
Phase 3 = 2092.61 sf
Total (Exist. + Ph1 + Ph2 + Ph3) = 7560.41 sf

Parish House: (Phase 4)
Existing: 2,743 sf plus 203 sf covered porch
Demo: 1,823 sf
Addition: 4,960 sf
Final: 5,880 sf plus 203 sf covered porch