SC&H

ATTEST SERVICES

Frederick County Government
Department of Fleet Services
Performance Audit

December 19, 2018

Report #18-02

POWERFUL MINDS | PASSIONATE TEAMS | PROVEN RESULTS

Table of Contents

I. Executive Summary

Background

SC&H Attest Services, P.C. (SC&H) has been engaged by the Frederick County Government (FCG, the County) Interagency Internal Audit Authority (IIAA) to conduct a performance audit (audit) of the Fleet Services Department (Fleet Services). The audit was performed in two phases; a planning and risk assessment survey phase (concluding in March 2018) and a testing phase. The following is a summary of the overall Fleet Services Department and its responsibilities. Additional detailed process information is located in the Detailed Observation section of this report.

Fleet Services operates three shops throughout the County; the Main, Transit, and Law Enforcement. Fleet Services is responsible for a comprehensive fleet management program of County vehicles. This includes vehicle acquisition, maintenance, fueling, inventory, replacement, and disposal processes for all FCG fleet owned vehicles. Fleet Services also provides maintenance services as needed for non-FCG Fleet Services owned vehicles such as Fire and Rescue Fleet.

The Fleet department currently services approximately 1,000 vehicles county-wide, 660 of which are County owned. The total replacement value of the 660 active vehicles is estimated to be approximately $33,542,955 and was budgeted to collect $4,345,291 in replacement fees from departments. Replacement fees are fees that Fleet Services collects on a monthly basis for each fleet owned vehicle used by FCG divisions and departments. Fleet Services expected revenue is budgeted at $10 million, which does not include replacement fees collected.

Fleet Services utilizes multiple third-party software systems to manage the Fleet function.

- FASTER is the fleet management software for vehicles, equipment, and parts inventory.
- Fuel Man is the system used to administer fueling operations and captures activity at commercial gas stations.
- Fuel Force is the system used to capture fuel activity at county gas stations.
- INFOR is the county's ERP system and is used to bill and collect for replacement, maintenance, and fueling charges.

Objectives

The following testing phase audit objectives were developed by SC&H based upon the understanding gained during the audit planning procedures and approved by the IIAA.

A. Review the fuel program to assess access and use, card restrictions/configurations, completeness/accuracy of department charges, and timely monitoring.
B. Verify the Replacement/Maintenance fund is calculated accurately.
C. Verify that periodic asset inventory counts are independently performed and in accordance with Fleet policies and procedures.
D. Verify P-Card purchases of part orders (stock and non-stock) are properly executed, received, reconciled, and approved.

E. Review physical security at each Fleet location to ensure that Fleet inventory assets are properly safeguarded.
F. Ensure Fleet owned vehicles received preventive maintenance timely, in accordance with COMAR.
G. Review FASTER user access to ensure that access is appropriately limited to current employees with a legitimate business need.

Scope

The audit process was initiated in January 2018 and completed in June 2018. The period in scope for the performance of this audit included all Fleet Services activity between July 1, 2017 through March 1, 2018.

Methodology and Approach

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

In order to obtain the necessary documentation to appropriately perform and conclude upon the objectives of this audit, SC&H conducted the following procedures.

Creation of Project Plan

Based on the understanding of the processes, risks, and related controls, SC&H developed an audit program to achieve the objectives described above. This program included detailed steps to address each objective with the goal of verifying the existence of sound internal controls and identifying opportunities for improvement.

Execution of Audit Program

SC&H executed the audit plan by completing the following tasks:

Objective Area	Attribute Tested	Test Type	Test Description
Fuel	Fuel Source Data	Sample/ Data Analytics	Obtained data download from Fuel Force, Fuel Man, and FASTER of all fuel activity from July 1, 2017 through February 1, 2018. The data was used to reconcile the source data (Fuel Man/ Fuel Force) to FASTER and verify all activity was completely and accurately transferred.
	Fuel Department Billing	Sample/ Data Analytics	For a sample of three months, verified that Fleet accurately passed through the monthly fuel charges to a sample of three departments, applying the appropriate

Objective Area	Attribute Tested	Test Type	Test Description
Fuel			mark-ups and calculations. The department sample selection was based on the value of fuel spent.
	Fuel Exceptions	Sample/ Data Analytics	For a period of seven months, calculated the volume of each exception type and identified the employee associated. Further, we verified that all exceptions were researched and resolved in a timely manner.
	Fuel Man Card Active Users	Data Analytics	Obtained an active Human Resources listing, and user access rights to Fuel Man. Verified all PIN and cardholders are active employees.
Inventory	Annual Inventory Count	Data Analytics	Verified that the annual inventory count was performed for each fleet shop. Verified that all discrepancies were correctly adjusted in FASTER and explanation justification was documented.
	Cyclical Inventory Count	Data Analytics	Verified that the weekly cyclical inventory count was completed for the Main Shop.
	LEC biannual Inventory Count	Data Analytics	Verified that the bi-annual inventory count was completed for the LEC. Verified that any discrepancies were adjusted correctly and provided adequate explanation.
	Inventory Turnover	Data Analytics	Identified the low or high inventory turnover for a two year history.
	P-Card Testing	Sample/ Data Analytics	For a sample of three months of P-Card Statements: • Verified that the Assistant Director or Director reviewed and approved each statement reconciliation. • Verified that all charges are supported by vendor invoices and have been received. • Verified that all charges over $2,500 had supporting documentation referencing an

Objective Area	Attribute Tested	Test Type	Test Description
			active contract, sole source justification, or three vendor quote. Verified that the vendors invoice referenced a work order and was charged within FASTER.
	Inventory Security	Walk-Through	Performed a walkthrough to ensure that all inventory was properly secured and safeguarded.
Replacement Fund	Lifecycle benchmark	Population	Reviewed the effectiveness of established lifecycles for reasonableness.
	Replacement Price Data	Data Analytics	For the population of 109 vehicle classes, calculated the difference between the listed cost to replace the vehicle and the most recent purchase price.
	Replacement Fees	Sampling	Obtained a sample of 22 vehicle classes. Calculated the difference between the listed replacement cost and current fleet market value and concluded if the current replacement fees would adequately cover the current fleet market value.
	Useful Life Extension	Data Analytics	Obtained data download from FASTER for all fleet vehicles. Identified and quantified all vehicle overpayments for replacement fees due to useful life extending beyond projections and determined if the collected replacement fees adequately covered the cost of the new vehicle.
Replacement Fund	Rate Source Data	Sampling	Obtained a sample of 22 vehicle classes and the Rate Model Worksheet. Verified all inputs within the selected vehicle classes are supported and reconcile to the applicable appropriate system source.
	Department Inventory Fees	Sampling	Obtained a sample of 20 departments. Verified that the appropriate fees were charged and applied in FASTER and INFOR based on the assigned inventory.

Objective Area	Attribute Tested	Test Type	Test Description
Maintenance	Maintenance Scheduling	Sample/ Data Analytics	For a sample of 10 new vehicles purchased in FY 2017, verified that maintenance schedule, plan, and warranty information was properly entered into FASTER.
	Past-Due Maintenance	Data Analytics	Obtained a population of vehicles. Identified all vehicles that were past-due for maintenance and had not been serviced in the last 12 months.
	Work-Order Completion	Sample/ Data Analytics	Verified that the appropriate 20% mark-up was applied to non-fleet owned vehicles for commercial work, internal work, and equipment not exceeding $300.

Summary of Work

After reviewing the processes in place and evaluating the current control environment, SC&H concludes that there are improvement opportunities that exist to mitigate associated risks.

The following section provides detailed observations and recommendations regarding 11 separate topics.

We appreciate the assistance and cooperation of the management and staff of the Department of Fleet Services who provided assistance in the performance of this audit. Please contact us if you have any questions or comments regarding any of the information contained in the performance audit report.

SC&H Attest Services, P.C.
Sparks, Maryland
December 19, 2018

II. Detailed Observations and Recommendations

Observation 1

Vehicle lifecycles and replacement fees for fleet vehicles do not align with actual usage.

Observation Detail

Fleet Services collects a monthly rate for each fleet owned vehicle used by FCG divisions and departments. There are two types of fees collected, replacement and maintenance fees. The monthly fee is calculated to cover replacement and maintenance costs over the defined lifecycle of each vehicle classification. Fleet services calculates vehicle replacement and maintenance fees for departments by vehicle class using an excel Rate Model. The replacement fee calculation totals the most recent acquisition cost of a vehicle within a class, total cost added acquisition equipment, and subtracts the expected salvage value of the vehicle. The estimated cost to replace is then divided by the defined life expectancy to determine the funds needed per year to replace the vehicle. The Director of Fleet Services assigns useful life based on history (average) and experience.

Findings

Fleet Services continues to collect replacement fees for vehicles that remain in service after departments' have paid for the vehicle in full. As long as the vehicle is active, each department is required to pay the monthly fee. Of the 650 active fleet owned inventory:

- The replacement fees for 184 (28%) vehicles have exceeded their cost to replace. The average overpayment is 140% of the listed replacement cost. Overpayments for the active fleet owned inventory totaled $2,368,124.30. Overpayment funds are not separated by department, but rather are in a collective general fund for use by any County department. The County maintains two different types of proprietary funds, enterprise funds and internal service funds. Enterprise funds are used to report the same functions as business-type activities in the Government-Wide Financial Statements. Internal service funds are an accounting device used to accumulate and allocate costs internally among the County's various functions and activities. The County uses internal service funds to account for worker's compensation, fleet services and voice services operations. Frederick County has three individual enterprise funds: the Water & Sewer Fund, the Solid Waste Management Fund and the Bell Court Apartments Fund. The Solid Waste Management fund accounts for the capital outlay, operation and maintenance of the County's recycling program and the County's landfill and, providing solid waste disposal service to County residents through commercial haulers. The Water and Sewer Enterprise Fund accounts for the acquisition and operation of utility systems providing water and sewer service to certain sections of the County. ***See Appendix A, Table 1 and Table 2.***
- Departments which do not keep a new vehicle through its entire life expectancy are not required to pay the outstanding remaining balance of the vehicle's replacement cost.
- A formalized methodology for determining an appropriate useful life of vehicles is not documented. Of the vehicles that have been paid past their listed lifecycle (paid more than 100% of the acquisition cost), the average number of years past the listed lifecycle is 5.5 years. ***See Appendix A, Table 3.***

Risks

- Replacement fees collected from departments are not capped or for the length of the vehicle's defined lifecycle, resulting in the potential for excessive department costs or insufficient funds to replace future vehicles.
- Ineffective inventory lifecycles can result in inaccurate resource planning.
- Active vehicles used by County employees may not be safe for use due to age and wear and tear.

Recommendation 1.1

Frederick County should determine whether its method of replacement fee collection is a responsible practice. If it is not, Fleet Services should terminate the collection of replacement fees once a department has completely paid for the vehicle based on the calculated rates and years. Further, a department that disposes or replaces a vehicle prior to full payment of the replacement cost should be required to pay the remaining balance of the vehicle. The terms of replacement fee collection should be documented in a formalized policy (including the accounting and reporting of Enterprise, General, or Internal Service funds).

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

1.1 Response

The current Fleet Management Rate Plan was established to defray the costs of vehicle use and replacement. The plan implements a long-range strategy for purchasing, operating, and disposing of vehicles.

There is no inflationary rate in the fleet replacement rate structure. Instead, Fleet recovers sufficient funds for replacement vehicles by averaging vehicle class purchase costs. Although imperfect, this system of averaging older and newer vehicle purchase costs is efficient and effective. Changing the current practice to an individual vehicle accounting system will significantly increase administrative time and costs. We understand that vehicle costs are collected beyond the acquisition price for vehicles. At times, those additional funds are maintained by Fleet to fund the Fleet Replacement Fund and offset the fact that there is no inflationary factor at this time. DPW/Fleet will initiate discussions with the Finance Division and Budget Office to incorporate an FY 2020 inflationary factor in the replacement portion of the Rate Model and alleviate vehicle overpayments.

Modification with respect to Enterprise Fund agencies may be justified; however, Fleet requires an opportunity to thoroughly review the impacts. Once reviewed, Fleet will work with the Finance Division and Budget Office to discuss the fund level impact of vehicle funding and payments.

Fleet anticipates completing this analysis by June 30, 2019. Upon completion of the analysis, Fleet will update their policies and procedures regarding vehicle charges and inflationary factors if deemed necessary.

Recommendation 1.2

Fleet Services Management should formally review, analyze, and update inventory life cycles on a scheduled basis. The review should compare listed life cycles to realized useful lives per

vehicles class. The review should be documented and should serve as the basis for establishing and supporting vehicle class life cycles.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

1.2 Response

Fleet reviews life cycles annually, during budget preparation. The process has never been formally documented; however, the review is typically performed by the Fleet Director, and life cycles are updated based upon an analysis of 24 months' data.

With this audit, Fleet will review Table 3 within the appendix; where some vehicle classes are shown to consistently last longer than the useful lives utilized. During this review process, Fleet will also review the cost benefit of aged vehicles to maintenance costs to assist in the determination of which route is less costly. Once the review is completed, all procedures and the annual review will be formally documented within Fleet policies and procedures.

Fleet will document an Inventory Life Cycle Update Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Observation 2

FCG does not allow Fleet Services to account for inflation when calculating vehicle replacement fees. Instead, Fleet Services rounds up the acquisition price of vehicles in the Rate Model when calculating fees.

Observation Detail

Fleet Services categorizes vehicles into various classifications. Currently, there are 100 unique active vehicle classifications. For each vehicle class, Fleet Services calculates a replacement fee. The calculated fee will be the amount to be paid for any vehicle within that class. The replacement fee calculation totals the most recent acquisition cost of a vehicle within a class and the cost of adding acquisition equipment, then subtracts the expected salvage value of the vehicle. The estimated cost to replace is then divided by the defined life expectancy to determine the funds needed per year to replace the vehicle. For the most recent acquisition cost of a vehicle, it uses the last price paid by Fleet to purchase that vehicle class. The FCG Budget department has communicated that an inflationary factor is not to be included when determining replacement fees. Fleet Services will round up the most recent price paid by various amounts in an effort to account for market price increases, without specifically accounting for inflation.

Findings

Based on data analytics performed of the 100 active vehicle classes, Fleet Services, on average, used a replacement cost that was 10% higher than the most recent purchase price. This is a result of rounding up the acquisition price by an arbitrary amount, while leaving the inflation value at zero. ***See Appendix A, Table 4.***

SC&H performed sample based testing to determine if collected replacement fees adequately covered the cost of new vehicles recently purchased by Fleet Services. A sample of 16 new

vehicles were tested from a population of 67 vehicles acquired in FY2017. The fee amount collected for 13 of the 16 vehicles did not cover the cost of the newly acquired vehicles. Specifically:

- Four vehicles were replaced with a shortage in fees totaling $55,736.01. It was noted that the same vehicle class was replaced/purchased.
    - For three of the four vehicles, overpayments were collected and the vehicles lasted beyond the listed lifecycle.
- Nine vehicles were replaced with a shortage in fees collected totaling $180,323.09. In these samples, a different vehicle class was replaced/purchased.

Further, a sample of six vehicle classes were selected to focus on vehicles that have not been purchased on a frequent basis to compare current market value to the listed price used by Fleet Services to calculate the replacement fee. The classes selected were last purchased between the years of 1996 and 2009. The sample was limited to six due to the complexity of retrieving market value (e.g. specifications, etc.). Our review found that five of six vehicle classes would be an average of $5,800 short of being able to replace the vehicle within the same class.

Risks

- The replacement fee calculation does not allow for inflation, as a result, there is an increased risk of insufficient funds to replace vehicles when the market price increases significantly from the previous purchase price.
- The current practice of rounding up is inconsistently applied, which can lead to ineffective resource planning.

Recommendation 2.1

Fleet Services Management should coordinate with the Budget department to develop an effective method for financial planning and the cost of market increases. Vehicles classes that are purchased infrequently are at risk for insufficient replacement funding due to unbudgeted market increases. Acquisition values used in the rate model should be updated annually with market prices rather than last price paid by the County. The methodology chosen should be documented through a formalized approved policy.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

2.1 Response

DPW/Fleet will initiate discussions with the Finance Division and Budget Office to incorporate an FY 2020 inflationary factor in the replacement portion of the Rate Model.

A Plan of Action is anticipated to be developed by March 31, 2019.

Observation 3

Rate Model replacement and maintenance fees are manually entered and calculated without an independent detailed secondary review.

Observation Detail

The Assistant Director of Fleet Services manually enters all data recorded within the Rate Model. There are three main worksheets within the Rate Model used to calculate the vehicle replacement fees; Vehicle Rental Rate, Sub-Totals, and Summary. The Rate Model spreadsheet relies on information from three sources: FASTER, other FCG departments (Accounting, Risk Management, Budget), and the Director of Fleet Services. Worksheets are cross-referenced and linked to determine the monthly rate each department needs to pay for their applicable fleet-owned vehicle(s). The Vehicle Rental Rate Worksheets are used to calculate the annual replacement and maintenance costs for each class of vehicle maintained by Fleet Services.

Findings

While there are formula based reconciliation checks used to identify certain errors, there is no formal secondary detailed review of the Rate Model once all inputs are entered into the worksheet to ensure accuracy of the transposed values.

Additionally, the FASTER reports used to populate the Rate Model cannot be retroactively run to generate the same outputs used at the time of populating the Rate Model. A scope limitation was noted during the audit. Supporting documentation used to calculate the "FY18 Rental Rate Worksheet" for each class was not retained and could not be regenerated or provided for audit purposes. When generated, the report displays a point in time value. If the same report is generated for a defined time period, the values are different due to work that has been performed to fleet since the report was last generated.

SC&H performed sample based testing to determine if FY18 Rate Model vehicle class rates were accurately entered into FASTER for billing purposes. A sample of 22 vehicle classes were reviewed from a population of 100 active classes. One vehicle class (S006AU SUV Full-size Marked AWD) was incorrectly entered into FASTER. The rate per the rate model should be $565, however the rate entered into FASTER was $600. A variance of $35 over per month was charged for the 10 active vehicles within the class. As a result, $2,450 in overbillings were identified.

Risks

- Incomplete and inaccurate maintenance data, can result in incorrect calculations of labor and parts for maintenance fees.

Recommendation 3.1

Fleet Services Management should retain source reports from FASTER that support the annual Rate Model calculations.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

3.1 Response

Fleet retains the FASTER system final report but not the source reports.

Fleet will begin retaining source reports as recommended, and they will be utilized in FY 2020 budget preparation.

Recommendation 3.2

Due to the volume of manually entered data, Fleet Services Management should implement a formalized second review of the vehicle rate sheets for data entry completeness and accuracy. Further, a process to conduct a secondary review of FASTER record entries for any mid-year vehicle class additions should be formalized.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

3.2 Response

Fleet will document the Data Entry Procedure, delineating roles and tasks including a second review process, **by June 30, 2019.**

Recommendation 3.3

Fleet Management should process credits/refunds to applicable departments for the overbillings which occurred for the vehicle class noted in the observation detail above.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

3.3 Response

The current process of averaging costs by class of vehicle evenly distributes costs among General Fund-supported agencies (as noted in response 1.1) as funds go back to the Fleet Replacement Fund. This is common practice in many governmental fleet operations. DPW/Fleet will initiate discussions with the Finance Division and Budget Office to incorporate an FY 2020 inflationary factor in the replacement portion of the Rate Model and alleviate vehicle overpayments.

Note that adjustments to life cycles over the last 10 years to meet County budget challenges resulted in under-billing and a deficit in the Replacement Fund. The practice of continual billing over the life of a vehicle has assisted in building the Fund back up and alleviated inflationary issues. At this time, Fleet will not process refunds to General Fund agencies. However, Fleet is working with Enterprise Fund agencies to determine if overbillings occurred and will take the appropriate course of action.

Once reviewed, Fleet will work with the Finance Division and Budget Office to discuss the fund level impact of vehicle funding and payments.

Fleet anticipates completing this analysis by June 30, 2019. Upon completion of the analysis, Fleet will update their policies and procedures regarding vehicle charges and inflationary factors if deemed necessary.

Observation 4

Annual, bi-annual, and cyclical parts storeroom inventory counts are not performed in accordance with Fleet Services procedures.

Observation Detail

Annually, complete inventory reviews are conducted at each of the three Fleet Service Shops. The shops are closed during a two day time period to facilitate an accurate count. The Assistant Director generates a Parts Inventory Detail Report from FASTER. The inventory is divided and assigned to teams of two Fleet Services personnel. Each team performs a blind count for the inventory assigned and returns the results to the Assistant Director for a reconciliation to the FASTER system. Any discrepancies are re-counted a second time (and third time if necessary) prior to the Assistant Director recording an adjustment to the count in FASTER. A copy of the records is then sent to Accounting. Access to add and remove parts and assign counts for stock inventory is restricted to the Assistant Director, Fleet Services Specialist II, and Administrative Specialist IV.

The Assistant Director oversees a bi-annual inventory review for the Fleet Service's Law Enforcement Shop. The Assistant Director generates an Inventory Count Sheet Report from FASTER. Two Inventory Specialists perform a blind count and submit the results to the Assistant Director for a reconciliation to the FASTER system. Any discrepancies are re-counted a second time by the Inventory Specialists prior to the Assistant Director recording an adjustment to the count in FASTER.

The Assistant Director oversees a weekly inventory review for the Fleet Service's Main Shop. FASTER generates a random sample selection through a Cyclical Report by dividing the total inventory by 52 weeks. Two Inventory Specialists perform a blind count and submit the results to the Assistant Director for a reconciliation to the FASTER system. Any discrepancies are re-counted a second time by at least two Inventory Specialists prior to the Assistant Director recording an adjustment to the count in FASTER.

Findings

The annual, bi-annual, and cyclical parts storeroom inventory counts are not performed in accordance with Fleet Services procedures. Specifically, the following was identified:

- The Law Enforcement Center (LEC) Bi-Annual Inventory Count Sheet form was not signed to evidence the individual(s) that performed the inventory count. The lack of signature results in a potential segregation of duties issue between the individual who conducts the initial inventory count and individual who makes the inventory adjustments within FASTER. Further, not all noted discrepancies were adjusted to reflect actual inventory on hand in FASTER.
  - Filter Oil CPH48 57060: Adjustment of +1
  - Filter Oil CPH500 NEW TAURUS: Adjustment of -1
  - Fire Extinguisher 440161: Adjustment of +7
  - Cable Tie STT277C 14": Adjustment of -4
  - Cable Tie 73280 4": Adjustment of -1

- Eight weeks of cyclical count documentation for the Main Shop Inventory reviews were selected. However, cyclical counts were not performed during the selected weeks.
- Inventory adjustments made in FASTER are not documented to capture adjustment reasons resulting from investigative research to understand the root cause for the discrepant inventory. The same adjustment language is used for each count adjustment made within the system.
- A formal process is not in place to review the volume of stock purchased to the volume of stock parts charged.
- No formal policies are documented to address expected inventory processes and procedures.

Risks

- An inconsistent or ineffective inventory process increases the risk of misappropriation of parts.
- Unauthorized or unwarranted inventory adjustments made in FASTER, can result in overstated or inaccurate assets.

Recommendation 4.1

Fleet Services Management should ensure that all inventory count documentation is signed and reviewed by all employees involved. The individuals performing the blind count should be independent of the individual entering adjustments in FASTER. Without documentation of those involved in the counts, proper segregation of duties cannot be verified.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

4.1 Response

The recommended procedures *are* followed during end-of-year inventory.

Fleet is now utilizing the recommended procedures for all cyclical inventories.

Fleet will document the Inventory Count Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 4.2

Fleet Services Management should ensure all inventory discrepancies identified during the annual, bi-annual, and cyclical counts are completely and accurately entered into FASTER. Fleet services Management should reconcile inventory results to the FASTER report of discrepancies to ensure completeness and accuracy. Further, Management should investigate, research, and document, the root cause of discrepancies.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

4.2 Response

Fleet currently complies with the recommended procedure and researches discrepancies.

Fleet will document the Inventory and Reconciliation Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 4.3
Fleet Services Management should implement a monitoring process to reconcile stock parts ordered to stock parts charged. This reconciliation will help ensure parts orders are used on work orders and can assist with ruling out misappropriation.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

4.3 Response
Fleet does not believe the recommendation is warranted.
Fleet's current work order review process includes a Parts Room review and a Maintenance Supervisor review to ensure all parts used are charged to the work order. These reviews are the final step before closing a work order. Reconciling stock parts ordered to stock parts charged is difficult because stock parts may sit on the shelf for months before being billed out.

Fleet will create a Stock Parts Monitoring Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Observation 5
Fuel transactions conducted at both County and commercial gas stations are not completely and accurately uploaded to FASTER for billing purposes.

Observation Detail
In order to fuel a vehicle at the expense to the County, Fleet Services issues Fuel Man cards (linked to a specific vehicle), an employee personal PIN, and the vehicle's mileage at the time of fueling are required. Fuel can be purchased at either commercial gas stations or County managed gas stations. The fuel activity at commercial gas stations is captured through the Fuel Man system. The Fleet Services Specialist II downloads a Weekly Fuel Report from Fuel Man for the prior week's transactions. The Fleet Services Specialist then uploads the data from the Weekly Fuel Report to FASTER. The fuel activity at county owned gas stations is captured through a Fuel Force system. The Fleet Services Specialist II downloads a Daily Fuel Report from Fuel Force for the prior day's transactions. The Fleet Services Specialist then uploads the data from the Daily Fuel Report to FASTER.

Fuel Expenditure Based on Fuel Station Type July 1, 2017 through March 1, 2018		
Station Type	**Gallons**	**Cost**
Fuel Force	596,262.46	$1,301,850.24
Fuel Man	240,945.60	$547,467.44
TOTAL	**837,208.06**	**$1,849,317.68**

Findings
We performed a reconciliation of fuel activity recorded in Fuel Man and Fuel Force between July 1, 2017 through March 1, 2018 to FASTER. The following was identified:

- Not all Fuel Man transactions were posted to FASTER
  - 1,331 transactions totaling $49,951.93
    - 469 Transactions between 9/25/2017 to 10/1/2017 were never uploaded to

FASTER in error totaling $13,335.26
    - 862 Transactions totaling $36,616.67 remain unexplained
- Not all Fuel Force transactions were posted to FASTER
    - 632 ($28,859.68), remain unexplained

Risks

- Fueling information is not completely or accurately uploaded into FASTER, resulting in theft of fuel, unreimbursed fuel costs, or misinformation/inaccurate reporting.

Recommendation 5.1

Fleet Services Management should formalize and document a reconciliation between Fuel Man Commercial Credit Card Invoices to each department's billings to verify all fuel costs have been captured and processed in FASTER. Periodically, Management should reconcile reports of fuel activity over a time period from Fuel Man and Fuel Force to FASTER to ensure completeness and accuracy of data transfer for billing.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

5.1 Response

Fleet concurs that a weekly process to verify the appropriate allocation of Fuel Man invoices to departments is prudent.

Fleet will document a Fuel Man Invoice Reconciliation Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Observation 6

The methodology used to calculate the monthly billings for fuel charges is not formalized and consistently applied, resulting in billing errors.

Observation Detail

The Fleet Services Specialist II downloads a Weekly Fuel Report from Fuel Man (commercial activity) for the prior week's transactions. The Fleet Services Specialist then uploads the data from the Weekly Fuel Report to FASTER. The fuel activity at County owned gas stations are captured through the Fuel Force system. The Fleet Services Specialist II downloads a Daily Fuel Report from Fuel Force for the prior day's transactions. The Fleet Services Specialist then uploads the data from the Daily Fuel Report to FASTER. Any errors or rejections to uploading in FASTER are captured in an Exception report which is reviewed, researched, and resolved by the Fleet Services Specialist.

Once the fuel activity has been transferred to FASTER, the Fleet Services Specialist works on the monthly billing (by post date) for each department. Fleet Services applies a $0.25 mark-up to every gallon for both County and commercial purchases. The mark-up funds are kept by Fleet Services for overhead and are not applied to the general fund. For Fuel Force activity, the Fleet Services Specialist uses a four week average of the County's cost per gallon for gas from Fuel Force to calculate the billable total. Fuel Man activity is based on the price paid by the driver at the commercial gas station.

Findings

The methodology for calculating the billing and mark-up of fuel charges is not formalized. A sample of three month's billings for three departments was re-performed. For the sample, the independently calculated totals did not reconcile to INFOR, the billing system. Further, Fleet Services does not manually calculate fuel costs based on the four week average for Fuel Force, but rather uses the most recent previous Fuel Force price per gallon entered into FASTER.

Department	Billing Variance 7/1/2017	Billing Variance 12/1/2017	Billing Variance 2/1/2018
1080 - County Executive	$0.00	$0.00	-$1.69
4411 - Highway & Transportation	-$791.99	$2,415.41	-$1,190.81
4401 - Solid Waste Management	-$1,468.12	-$5,180.39	-$4,697.14

Additionally, data analytics identified the top five fuel users in the County. An inquiry was made to department heads to which these users were assigned for a reasonableness check. The top two users were from the Solid Waste department. Per inquiry, it was determined that due to the nature of work, fuel is dispensed from a County station to a large mobile fuel tank by one of the employees. The mobile fuel tank is then used to fuel non-vehicle equipment out in the field. The fuel dispensed from the mobile fuel tank to the smaller pieces of equipment is recorded on a log and later entered into FASTER directly by the second employee. This serves as record keeping for maintenance schedules and to account for how the fuel is used from the mobile tank. When the monthly billing occurs, a reconciliation between the mobile tank and the activity of the smaller equipment is to be performed by Fleet Services. Once reconciled, the transactions in FASTER for the mobile tank is to be removed from billing to avoid charging for the same fuel twice. The expectation that all fuel in the mobile tank are used in a billing period is not practical, as such, the reconciliation allows for a 25% difference for any fuel left in the tank. Per inquiry with Fleet Services Management, it was determined that double billing is occurring for Solid Waste fuel charges and activity is double counted/not backed out.

Risks

- Lack of a formalized methodology to facilitate the calculation of department billings for fuel charges can result in over or under payments.

Recommendation 6.1

Fleet Services Management should establish and document a formalized methodology for calculating fuel costs for billing purposes. The methodology should be approved by any necessary parties (Division Head, Budget Department, etc.).

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

6.1 Response

Fleet will document a Fuel Cost Calculation Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 6.2
Fleet Services should implement a formalized independent review of monthly billing calculations to ensure completeness and accuracy.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date
6.2 Response

Fleet Services tabulates hundreds of transactions on a daily basis in reference to equipment inventory, parts inventory, maintenance and labor hours, etc. These transactions are verified by Service Managers, Administrative Personnel, and Management based on the category of these transactions. These totals are consolidated monthly and a billing report is generated by Fleet Services. This information is then transmitted to the Infor System by way of an interface. Once completed, the Infor billing totals are compared to the FASTER totals to assure the data has been accurately transferred. If any discrepancies occur, the Fleet Services Specialist researches the differences and corrections are made. Accounting then bills the verified data provided by FASTER. Knowing that FASTER and Infor generally match due to the interface, Fleet understands that a comprehensive review and reconciliations of underlying data of fuel logs and FASTER reports is needed from time to time. Unfortunately, there is a lack of resources and proper documentation at this time to incorporate these reviews systematically. Fleet will review the processes and determine procedures, roles and processes which can be implemented to review logs to the FASTER system.

Fleet will document a Monthly Billing Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 6.3
Fleet Services Management should coordinate and collaborate with Solid Waste Management to request, and review fuel logs dating back to the time period where Solid Waste began independently entering fuel transactions directly into FASTER for dispenses from the mobile fuel tank. The review should identify the total amount double billed, and a refund should be issued to the Solid Waste Department for enterprise fund purposes.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date
6.3 Response

As noted in Response 6.2, Fleet Services agrees with the recommendation and performed a comprehensive review of fuel logs and FASTER reports. However, lack of resources and proper documentation have prevented Fleet from achieving a complete reconciliation for FY18 with any certainty of accuracy.

Procedures will be implemented beginning September 1, 2018 to capture and bill fuel dispensed into the mobile tank and not bill the fuel dispensed into the equipment, eliminating the need for Fleet to perform future reconciliations of the mobile tank to the equipment.

Recommendation 6.4
Fleet Services Management should implement a monitoring and reconciliation process on a periodic basis (e.g. monthly) to ensure Solid Waste fuel charges are completely and accurately

accounted for prior to billing. The reconciliation between the fuel tank and fuel logs should be formalized and reviewed by both Fleet Services Management and Solid Waste Management prior to billing. As a result of the review, Fleet Services and Solid Waste Management have agreed on a trial process to create a separate bill code for the large mobile fuel tank. The bill code will be marked "off" to ensure double billing does not reoccur, while still retaining all of the fuel activity in FASTER. Original transactional information should not be deleted from the FASTER System at any point in the billing process.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

6.4 Response

Currently fuel dispensed is recorded manually and entered into FASTER by Solid Waste personnel.

***Effective September 1, 2018**, Fleet is tracking the Solid Waste Mobile Tank Truck fuel for billing to Solid Waste; fuel cards for individual vehicles have been disabled so that fuel dispensed is not billed; and hour metering is being maintained for maintenance scheduling purposes.*

Recommendation 6.5

Fleet Services Management should consider researching solutions for capturing mobile fuel transactions at the time of dispense that could be transferred into FASTER electronically out in the field rather than manual records and entry.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

6.5 Response

Fleet does not believe the recommendation is cost effective.

Based upon Division of Utilities and Solid Waste Management costs for truck-mounted equipment to monitor fuel dispensing ($27,000), Fleet believes this option is prohibitively expensive.

Recommendation 6.6

Fleet Services Management should consider performing data analytics on a quarterly basis of fuel dispense to mobile fuel trucks used by the Solid Waste Department to ensure overlapping quantities of "non-dispensed" fuel over a period of time are accounted. Large discrepancies identified in subsequent dispenses to smaller equipment should be researched and resolved.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

6.6 Response

Fleet agrees that an analysis of fuel dispensed from the mobile fuel truck is warranted. Fleet will work with Solid Waste staff to document a Reconciliation Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by ***March 31, 2019***.

Observation 7

Fuel exceptions are not reviewed and trended to identify patterns to deter unwanted behaviors.

Further, a fuel exception that was manually resolved was erroneously billed to a department twice.

Observation Detail

FASTER generates an exception rejection report of all transaction unsuccessfully posted to FASTER. The exceptions remain in a queue until researched and resolved by the Fleet Services Specialist II. Once resolved, the transaction will post in FASTER. Exceptions captured by the FASTER system include:

- Miscellaneous Charges
- Wrong Gas Type (only possible at commercial gas stations)
- Incorrect Mileage (fueling still allowed at commercial gas station 250C, 1000F)
- Incorrect Pin Entry - three time fail
- Wrong Pin- entered someone else's Pin
- Gallons exceed vehicle tank capacity

Exception Code Description	Number of Exception Records	Total Gallons in Exception Report	Percentage of Total Exception Population
Odometer entry is out of sequence	248	4,557	86%
Fuel volume exceeds vehicles tank capacity	13	530	10%
Vehicle is restricted from purchasing this fuel	17	224	4%
Grand Total	**278**	**5,311**	**100%**

Findings

The review of FASTER exceptions that occurred between November 30, 2017 and February 1, 2018 and the FASTER Report detailing transactions from July 1, 2017 and March 1, 2018, found the following:

- Nine exception records were missing from FASTER. Per further inquiry it was determined that these transactions were eventually entered into FASTER but not timely, after March 1, 2018 (report end date).
    - Upon manual intervention to resolve the exceptions, a transaction was posted and charged to the department twice.
- High-level exception data to review employee, department, and exception type trending is not monitored, reviewed or communicated to departments to reduce future exception volumes. ***See Appendix A, Table 5***

Risks

- Fueling information does not completely or accurately post to FASTER, resulting in unbilled and unreimbursed fuel costs and misinformation.
- Lack of communication between Fleet Services and departments of fuel exception, results in an inefficient use of resources to manually resolve. Further, mileage entry errors at the time of fueling subsequently reduce the accuracy of preventative maintenance

scheduling.

Recommendation 7.1

Fleet Services Management should implement a formalized process to monitor the completeness and accuracy of fuel exception resolutions.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

7.1 Response

Fleet currently employs a procedure to monitor exceptions and corrective actions. Effective immediately, exceptions will be reviewed and approved by the Fleet Services Director.

Fleet will document a Fuel Exception Resolution Procedure, delineating roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 7.2

Fleet Services Management should analyze fuel exception data by employee, department, and exception type on a scheduled recurring basis. The results and outliers (e.g. top users) should be discussed with department leadership and employees with the most frequent exceptions. Training and reminders should be given as necessary, and conversations should be documented. Recurring unwanted behavior by end users should be escalated for correction to reduce future exception volumes, inefficient use of resources, and inaccurate system data.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

7.2 Response

The Fuel Exception Resolution Procedure will include the production of a Monthly Exception Chart. The chart will display employee, department, and exception type data and will be transmitted to division leadership for resolution. Fleet will request division leadership to respond in 30 days with noted action on the exceptions noted in order to understand that exceptions were discussed with employees and that employees understand the issues in which exception was taken in order to promote appropriate fuel use behaviors.

The Monthly Exception Chart is anticipated to be complete and available for dissemination June 30, 2019.

Observation 8

Access to Fuel Man is not properly restricted or monitored.

Observation Detail

Access to request and issue Fuel Man credit cards and individual PINs is restricted to the Fleet Services Specialist II and Administrative Assistant. Every six months, the Fleet Services Specialist II generates an Active Fuel Man User Report. The report contains a list of all employees with a Fuel Man PIN. The report is manually divided and sent to each department head for review. Department heads review the list of active users assigned to their department and verify active employment status and business need. If there are discrepancies, the

Department head notifies the Specialist, who deactivates the PIN within the Fuel Man system. Further, Fleet Services is included in notification of FCG terminations via e-mail for updates on a real-time basis.

Findings

The process in place to review Fuel Man access is not consistently performed or effective. Fuel Man access is not properly restricted or monitored. Of the 2,130 active Fuel Man users, 797 users were non-matches to an active HR Report. Of the 797 non-matches, we verified the following:

- 125 users are no longer actively employed by the County.
- Four users are active employees that have changed positions internally and no longer require Fuel Man access.
- Two users have duplicate active usernames (4). These two were duplicated in the Fuel Man system. When Fleet tried to remove the oldest, the system would not allow the action to remove its duplication. Since Fuel Man has changed their software Fleet has had a few new issues and this is one of them. Fleet has spoken with the account manager at Fuel Man and they are aware of the issues. Fleet did however make one change to each ID, and was then allowed to remove them from the active system.
- The active status of 168 users could not be verified timely.
- 506 were deemed active and have a business need.

Risks

Inappropriate user access could result in unauthorized transactions and/or the misappropriation of County assets.

Recommendation 8.1

Fleet Services Management should remove access to the terminated users identified during the audit and should follow-up and resolve unverified outstanding users with departments. Further, Management should obtain the termination dates of the inactive users identified, and verify that fuel activity has not occurred by the user after employment ended.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

8.1 Response

Complete. Fleet has addressed and removed access for those identified during the audit. Fleet has also verified other outstanding users with departments to ensure that fuel activity has not occurred after termination dates, see also management's response to Recommendation 9.1.

Fleet now receives new hire/termination notification from Human Resources. A terminated user is deactivated; deactivated users are unable to access fuel.

Recommendation 8.2

Fleet Services Management should ensure the process in place to have Department heads review the list of active users assigned to their department and verify active employment status and

business need is performed on a scheduled, recurring basis.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

8.2 Response

As Fleet is now notified of terminations, Fleet is able to disable fuel access upon termination. An annual analysis of employee status/need is prudent.

Fleet will document a Fuel Privilege Verification Procedure on the departmental/division level, including roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Observation 9

Access to FASTER is not properly restricted or monitored.

Observation Detail

FASTER is the fleet management software for vehicles, equipment, and parts inventory. FASTER is used to manage the inventory, document maintenance, prepare department billing, etc. Access to add and remove parts and assign counts for stock inventory is restricted to the Assistant Director, Fleet Services Specialist II, and Administrative Specialist IV. Administrators for FASTER are the Fleet Services Specialist II and the Assistant Director of Fleet Services. Representatives at Frederick County Public School (FCPS) have administrator level access as well.

Findings

Administration of FASTER access is not centrally managed, resulting in inconsistency in access levels and terminations. Specifically:

- One active employee whom no longer has a business need for FASTER.
- Five generic usernames not assigned to a specific individual. Based on the access levels, monitoring of activity by these usernames should be performed.
- The active status of 42 users could not be verified timely.
- Standard operating procedures for granting and removing access are not formalized, resulting in unexpected levels of access that are inconsistently granted without a business need.

Risks

Inappropriate user access could result in unauthorized transactions and/or the misappropriation of County assets.

Recommendation 9.1

Fleet Services Management should remove access to the terminated users identified during the audit and should follow-up and resolve unverified outstanding users with departments.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

9.1 Response

Complete.

Recommendation 9.2
Fleet Services Management should implement a process to have Department heads review the list of active users assigned to their department and verify active employment status and business need is performed on a scheduled, recurring basis.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date
9.2 Response

Fleet will document a Fuel Privilege Verification Procedure on the departmental/division level, including roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 9.3
A formalized method for determining an appropriate level of access should be documented for consistent management of access. Access should be centrally managed by a designated Administrator with a back-up individual assigned and trained to perform procedures correctly.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date
9.3 Response

Fleet shares FASTER with other agencies, including the Division of Parks and Recreation, Division of Utilities and Solid Waste Management Landfill, and the Frederick County Public Schools (FCPS) Fleet Shop. Currently, there are three individuals with administrative access to FASTER, two in Fleet and one in FCPS. FCPS has a demonstrated need to retain this access. Fleet understands that consistency can be an issue between the different administrators. Fleet will work to maintain the use of the three administrators but will document policies and procedures to make access consistent among all three.

Fleet will document policies and procedures by June 30, 2019

Observation 10

Preventative maintenance is not performed timely for all active fleet inventory. Further, vehicles are not replaced timely based on life expectancy, incurred maintenance costs, and replacement fees collected.

Observation Detail
Upon receiving a new vehicle, the Assistant Director enters the vehicle's manufacturer warranty and maintenance schedule/ preventative maintenance (PM) plan into FASTER based on the Vehicle Check-In Sheet completed by a Service Manager. PM is the act of inspecting, repairing, and maintaining vehicles in such a way that defects are prevented from surfacing. All vehicles are assigned to a specific Fleet Services shop for service. The Service Manager generates the FASTER PM Due report for the next month to begin scheduling with departments. The report is configured to identify vehicles/equipment requiring PM, based on usage (measured by miles and hours). Inaccuracies in scheduling can exist as a result from inaccurate vehicle mileage entry at

the time of fueling. Any errors identified are corrected in FASTER by the Service Manager.

The Director of Fleet Services monitors maintenance costs for each vehicle. As a general rule, once 75% of the vehicle's purchase price is spent on maintenance, the Director of Fleet Services begins the evaluation process to determine whether the vehicle should be auctioned, traded, or repurposed.

Findings

Based on data analytics performed, 132 active fleet owned vehicles/equipment incurred maintenance costs that exceed 75% of the acquisition cost. ***See Appendix A, Table 6***. Specifically:

- 97 vehicles have been paid for in full through replacement fees collected and $1,641,924.01 in overpayment fees.
- The average maintenance costs incurred was 108%. FCG is incurring high maintenance costs for vehicles that have already been funded to replace.
- 11 vehicles have an average maintenance cost of 101% of the total acquisition cost, but are only between 50-79% collected for replacement fees.

A formal process is not in place to perform an annual inventory review of all vehicles or equipment. Fleet Services attempts to inventory the fleet through the maintenance process, as all items are expected to be serviced at least annually. Specifically:

- PM vehicle schedules (based on date) not serviced in the past 12 months: 50 PM schedules (44 unique vehicles/equipment).
- PM vehicle schedules (based on mileage) exceeding cycle length: 28 PM schedules (24 unique vehicles/equipment).
- Seven of ten newly acquired vehicles reviewed did not have warranty information entered into FASTER.

Risks

Maintenance on fleet vehicles is not performed timely, resulting in shortened lifecycles and increased costs. Active warranties are not utilized, resulting in increased costs.

Recommendation 10.1

Fleet Services Management should review the analytics performed as a result of the audit and determine the cost benefit of continuing to perform high maintenance costs on vehicles and equipment well past the established lifecycle. Based on maintenance costs and replacement fees collected, a financial decision should be considered to replace.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

10.1 Response

Life cycle analysis is primarily a budgeting tool. The vehicle life is projected based on several factors, including historical maintenance costs and utilization, which are subject to variation and may impact vehicle retention, contrary to the established life cycle.

As stated in Management's response 1.1 and 1.2, DPW/Fleet will initiate discussions with the Finance Division and Budget Office to incorporate an FY 2020 inflationary factor in the replacement portion of the Rate Model and alleviate vehicle overpayments which in turn will flow through to vehicle life cycles. During this review process, Fleet will also review the cost benefit of aged vehicles to maintenance costs, to assist in the determination of which route is less costly. Once the review is completed all procedures and the annual review will be formally documented within Fleet policies and procedures. Table 6 does reflect that many vehicles are over 75% of their replacement costs in maintenance cost.

Fleet will document this review and determine next steps by August 2019

Recommendation 10.2

Fleet Services Management should perform maintenance to acquisition costs analytics on a periodic basis (e.g. annual) that includes factors such as life cycle, years in service, replacement fees collected, maintenance work performed to assess the best financial decision to the County. The review should be documented and decisions should be justified and supported.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

10.2 Response

Fleet currently follows the recommended process annually, and also when making decisions on large vehicle repairs. Annually, Fleet creates a spreadsheet to determine vehicle replacements. Replacement is based upon factors including life cycles, maintenance, mileage, and costs. It was noted during this audit, per Table 6, that many vehicles are over 75% of their acquisition costs in maintenance cost. See our response to Recommendation 10.1 and Fleet's plan to review the cost benefit of aged vehicles to maintenance costs.

Recommendation 10.3

Fleet Services Management should consider implementing an inventory process for active fleet vehicles and equipment. While the volume and location may be difficult to track for all items, the review should be focused on items that have not come in for service in the last year, thus reducing the amount of items needed to track. This review should be performed on a recurring, periodic basis (e.g. annual). Items that cannot be located should involve the department owner for resolution.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

10.3 Response

This recommendation is addressed via monthly preventive maintenance reports produced by each service manager. Although created to schedule routine maintenance, the reports also document levels of utilization. Fleet believes it is appropriate to implement a procedure to

address vehicles that are not presented for scheduled maintenance. Fleet recognizes that the audit identified vehicles that were not brought in. Fleet will send notifications and work to find missing vehicles and equipment on an annual basis for inventory purposes to ensure the vehicle or equipment is accounted for within the County.

Fleet will document a Vehicle Service Review Procedure, including roles and tasks, by June 30, 2019.

Recommendation 10.4

Fleet Services Management should ensure that all new vehicles purchased are added into FASTER and capture the applicable warranty information for future service reference. A vehicle check-in review should include verifying necessary information was entered into FASTER as a complete and accurate record.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

10.4 Response

Fleet currently complies with the recommended procedures, however understands that 7 of 10 vehicles tested did not have warranty information in FASTER. Fleet will review the 7 of 10 vehicles noted during the audit and will add policy/procedures so that when vehicles are brought in annually for service, the service team will check that warranty information has been input into FASTER appropriately. Fleet management will incorporate a spot check review on new vehicles to ensure all warranty information is input.

Fleet will implement these steps and document them within policies and procedures by June 30, 2019

Observation 11

Use of P-Cards for parts ordering are not in line with purchasing best practices.

Observation Detail

All parts are ordered through P-Cards. The Administrative Assistant has access and charges P-Cards assigned to other Fleet Services employees. The following individuals have access to a P-Card: Inventory Specialists (2, $70K limit each), Service Managers (3, $50K limit each), Director, Assistant Director, Fleet Services Specialist, and the Administrative Specialist. When placing stock orders for each location, the Administrative Assistant charges the Inventory Specialist's P-Card at the Main Shop. Tire stock orders are charged to the Assistant Director's P-Card. For orders over $2,500, the Service Manager or Inventory Specialist must submit a Special Order Support Form that details at least three quotes from different vendors (if the item is not available through an active contract). The Inventory Specialist marks all vendor invoices with the work order number to verify that each non-stock part has been captured and charged in FASTER. At the end of each month, the Inventory Specialist and Administrative Assistant reconcile P-Card charges. The reconciliation includes verifying the quantity, price, and part number agree to the original purchase. The Assistant Director or Director must approve the monthly reconciliation. After approval, the reconciliation is physically sent to Purchasing for final approval prior to payment.

Findings

Our review of the parts ordering process found:

- At the time of monthly P-Card statement reviews, a verification that non-stock part purchases are charged to a work-order is not performed.
- A formal process is not in place to require approval of non-stock parts prior to purchase. The process to ensure the best or competitive price is identified and selected is informal.
- Proper segregation of duties is not in place for the procurement of inventory. The parts are ordered on the Inventory Specialists P-Card who also receives the inventory.
- The Administrative Assistant has access to and charges P-Cards assigned to other Fleet Services employees.

Our review of 15 P-Card statements found:

- Purchase of $83.94 was not marked as stock and did not reference a work order number.
- Supporting documentation for individual parts purchases greater than $2,500 did not have proper supporting documentation.
    - Fleet Services made two purchases of $7,786.57 and $10,976.15 from Atlantic Emergency Solutions. The supporting documentation reviewed for testing did not have a price quote from three different vendors, further, Atlantic Emergency Solutions does not have an active contract with the County. Atlantic Emergency Solutions is a sole source vendor and Fleet can only purchase certain fire truck parts from this particular vendor. Invoices exceeding $2,500 for sole source vendors require a note on the invoice to indicate to Purchasing that the vendor is a sole source. Per FCG Procurement policy, The using agency requesting a sole source procurement shall provide written evidence to support a sole source.

Risks

- Unauthorized purchase of vehicle parts, resulting in misappropriation or increased costs.
- Part orders are not received, resulting in payments for items not received.
- Non-stock inventory charges are not captured.

Recommendation 11.1

Fleet Services Management should ensure activity charged to a P-Card should only be executed by the cardholder themselves. Access to charge other cardholder's P-Cards should be removed.

Further, the employee receiving the order should not have the activity charged to his/ her card to allow for segregation of duties.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

11.1 Response

Sometimes operational necessity warrants the provision of a supervisor's P-Card to a vendor via the supervisor's subordinate; therefore, the charge access must remain.

The second part of this recommendation may be addressed simply by increasing the credit limits of employees tasked with ordering parts.

Increased credit limits for employees who order parts are anticipated to take effect October 1, 2018.

Recommendation 11.2

At the time of invoice review and approval by the Director or Assistant Director of Fleet Services, support should be provided within the reconciliation documentation to verify that non-stock items have been completely and accurately charged to a work order. Monthly, reconciliations should not be approved until all non-stock items have been properly charged.

Management's Action Plan and Implementation Date

11.2 Response

Invoices currently include a note providing the work order and vehicle number, and verification may be obtained by researching the work order in FASTER.
When the Technician completes the assigned work, the work order is reviewed by the Inventory Specialist; then the work order is reviewed by the Service Manager to ensure all parts and labor are recorded prior to closing. When the P-Card Statement reaches the Director or Assistant Director, the work order has undergone at least three reviews.

Based upon current staffing and invoice volume, random review is possible, but comprehensive reconciliation by the Director or Assistant Director is not. Fleet does recognize with non-stock items there is a greater risk to theft. A random review will be implemented and documented within policies and procedures. The review will be a spot check during the P-Card approval process and will match the P-Card charge to the work order for non-stock items.

Fleet will document this review within policies and procedures by June 30, 2019

Appendix A

TABLE 1 REPLACEMENT FEE OVERPAYMENTS						
DEPARTMENT	EQUIPMENT ID	VEHICLE CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	OVER PAID AMOUNT	% PAID
1205	36069	C006U	$17,562.00	$41,989.00	-$24,427.00	239%
5201	35804	V010U	$15,798.00	$31,822.00	-$16,024.00	201%
5201	36087	V010U	$15,722.00	$31,560.00	-$15,838.00	201%
5201	35803	V010U	$15,798.00	$31,588.00	-$15,790.00	200%
5413	36458	C005RU	$21,068.00	$41,131.00	-$20,063.00	195%
4111	36158	E019D	$61,331.00	$116,746.27	-$55,415.27	190%
4111	35990	E044N	$8,998.00	$17,043.27	-$8,045.27	189%
4111	35991	E044N	$8,998.00	$17,043.27	-$8,045.27	189%
4111	35992	E044N	$8,998.00	$17,043.27	-$8,045.27	189%
4360	35801	V010U	$15,798.00	$29,897.00	-$14,099.00	189%
1205	36494	C007U	$22,852.14	$42,930.00	-$20,077.86	188%
5201	33264	V010U	$17,080.00	$31,822.00	-$14,742.00	186%
6030	36071	T001U	$11,719.00	$21,401.00	-$9,682.00	183%
9171	36362	C005RU	$20,476.00	$36,794.00	-$16,318.00	180%
1205	36333	C003U	$12,489.00	$22,271.00	-$9,782.00	178%
7101	36073	B14ND	$40,934.34	$72,848.00	-$31,913.66	178%
7101	36074	B14ND	$40,934.34	$72,848.00	-$31,913.66	178%
4111	36164	E044N	$9,500.00	$16,905.00	-$7,405.00	178%
4111	36165	E044N	$9,500.00	$16,905.00	-$7,405.00	178%
5201	36349	V010U	$16,477.96	$28,678.00	-$12,200.04	174%
4401	36083	T010U	$17,596.00	$30,056.00	-$12,460.00	171%
5413	37151	C005RU	$23,948.41	$40,365.00	-$16,416.59	169%
5413	35802	V010U	$15,798.00	$26,597.00	-$10,799.00	168%
4360	36053	T007U	$17,346.00	$29,067.00	-$11,721.00	168%
6030	35972	C001U	$10,118.00	$16,860.00	-$6,742.00	167%
6030	35973	C001U	$10,118.00	$16,860.00	-$6,742.00	167%
8103	37146	S007U	$23,543.54	$39,205.00	-$15,661.46	167%
4501	35864	T012D	$28,909.00	$47,905.00	-$18,996.00	166%
4360	35949	T039U	$23,585.90	$39,051.00	-$15,465.10	166%
1205	36493	C006U	$21,955.22	$36,228.00	-$14,272.78	165%
5414	35798	T036U	$20,142.00	$33,163.88	-$13,021.88	165%
4115	36311	T001U	$12,143.00	$19,981.00	-$7,838.00	165%
4115	36312	T001U	$12,143.00	$19,981.00	-$7,838.00	165%
4401R	35780	T007U	$17,852.00	$29,324.00	-$11,472.00	164%
1205	37363	C007U	$22,975.34	$37,663.00	-$14,687.66	164%
4360	36346	V010U	$16,367.00	$26,753.00	-$10,386.00	163%
4360	36348	V010U	$16,367.00	$26,753.00	-$10,386.00	163%
4111	36186	T070D	$95,118.72	$153,907.00	-$58,788.28	162%
4111	36191	T070D	$95,118.72	$153,907.00	-$58,788.28	162%

TABLE 1 REPLACEMENT FEE OVERPAYMENTS						
DEPARTMENT	EQUIPMENT ID	VEHICLE CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	OVER PAID AMOUNT	% PAID
1205	37365	C007U	$23,318.57	$37,663.00	-$14,344.43	162%
4111	36168	T047D	$33,469.00	$53,991.00	-$20,522.00	161%
1250	35867	V010U	$18,788.00	$30,258.00	-$11,470.00	161%
1250	37381	C007U	$23,523.67	$37,663.00	-$14,139.33	160%
1253	37377	C007U	$23,561.25	$37,663.00	-$14,101.75	160%
4310	35796	T036U	$20,142.00	$32,073.00	-$11,931.00	159%
4310	35797	T036U	$20,142.00	$32,073.00	-$11,931.00	159%
4215	35729	T001U	$13,609.00	$21,543.00	-$7,934.00	158%
8302	35734	T001U	$13,609.00	$21,543.00	-$7,934.00	158%
1205	37093	C003U	$12,587.67	$19,897.00	-$7,309.33	158%
4115	35499	T001U	$13,609.00	$21,375.54	-$7,766.54	157%
1205	36491	C006U	$23,132.30	$36,228.00	-$13,095.70	157%
4401	36109	T040U	$26,609.00	$41,637.00	-$15,028.00	156%
3410	35868	C004U	$16,470.00	$25,520.00	-$9,050.00	155%
6030	35886	C001U	$10,921.00	$16,860.00	-$5,939.00	154%
6030	35892	C001U	$10,921.00	$16,860.00	-$5,939.00	154%
6030	35893	C001U	$10,921.00	$16,860.00	-$5,939.00	154%
6030	35895	C001U	$10,921.00	$16,860.00	-$5,939.00	154%
6030	35897	C001U	$10,921.00	$16,860.00	-$5,939.00	154%
5413	35988	V002U	$15,748.00	$24,173.00	-$8,425.00	153%
4360	36469	C005RU	$23,072.28	$35,334.00	-$12,261.72	153%
4111	35994	E005D	$21,998.00	$33,680.27	-$11,682.27	153%
7421	35891	C001U	$10,921.00	$16,718.73	-$5,797.73	153%
5414	35722	T004U	$16,397.00	$25,010.00	-$8,613.00	153%
1201	35806	C003U	$15,800.00	$24,075.00	-$8,275.00	152%
4111	36161	E025D	$62,109.19	$94,310.27	-$32,201.08	152%
4111	36162	E025D	$62,109.19	$94,310.27	-$32,201.08	152%
4111	36013	T054D	$54,035.94	$81,751.88	-$27,715.94	151%
5414	36316	T004U	$15,098.00	$22,813.00	-$7,715.00	151%
5413	35848	T001U	$13,609.00	$20,517.00	-$6,908.00	151%
4111	35836	E013D	$74,500.00	$111,791.27	-$37,291.27	150%
4111	35837	E013D	$74,500.00	$111,791.27	-$37,291.27	150%
4111	35784	E003D	$62,800.00	$94,145.27	-$31,345.27	150%
5201	37325	C005RU	$24,849.65	$37,213.00	-$12,363.35	150%
4360	36098	T040D	$29,581.00	$44,236.00	-$14,655.00	150%
4401	35733	T001U	$13,609.00	$20,346.00	-$6,737.00	150%
6321	36488	C005RU	$23,347.93	$34,836.00	-$11,488.07	149%
1205	37357	C006U	$21,354.29	$31,786.00	-$10,431.71	149%
4111	34217	E005D	$21,818.00	$32,240.27	-$10,422.27	148%
4111	36321	T070D	$98,454.05	$145,329.00	-$46,874.95	148%
4111	36322	T070D	$98,454.05	$145,329.00	-$46,874.95	148%

TABLE 1 REPLACEMENT FEE OVERPAYMENTS						
DEPARTMENT	EQUIPMENT ID	VEHICLE CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	OVER PAID AMOUNT	% PAID
4111	36323	T070D	$98,454.05	$145,329.00	-$46,874.95	148%
4111	36324	T070D	$98,454.05	$145,329.00	-$46,874.95	148%
4111	36326	T070D	$98,454.05	$145,329.00	-$46,874.95	148%
5101	36499	T083D	$40,407.76	$59,157.00	-$18,749.24	146%
4111	36184	E005D	$22,905.00	$33,502.00	-$10,597.00	146%
5413	37321	C005RU	$24,606.46	$35,947.00	-$11,340.54	146%
5413	36086	T083D	$26,460.00	$38,630.00	-$12,170.00	146%
4215	36486	C005RU	$23,927.52	$34,836.00	-$10,908.48	146%
4111	36325	T070D	$98,454.05	$142,771.00	-$44,316.95	145%
4215	36473	C005RU	$22,913.41	$33,051.00	-$10,137.59	144%
9400	36318	C001U	$10,728.00	$15,441.00	-$4,713.00	144%
4401	35865	V005U	$18,788.00	$26,961.00	-$8,173.00	144%
4401R	36313	T004U	$15,098.00	$21,649.00	-$6,551.00	143%
4115	37102	T001U	$12,728.09	$18,123.00	-$5,394.91	142%
4501	34409	T036U	$23,575.00	$33,354.00	-$9,779.00	141%
4501	36390	T052D	$52,185.25	$72,735.00	-$20,549.75	139%
5413	35888	C001U	$10,921.00	$15,074.00	-$4,153.00	138%
1250	36479	C005RU	$23,877.94	$32,674.00	-$8,796.06	137%
4111	36497	T091D	$31,572.90	$42,765.00	-$11,192.10	135%
4111	37052	T070D	$104,091.84	$136,489.00	-$32,397.16	131%
4111	37051	T070D	$104,096.09	$136,489.00	-$32,392.91	131%
4111	37055	T070D	$104,156.10	$136,489.00	-$32,332.90	131%
4111	37056	T070D	$104,326.49	$136,489.00	-$32,162.51	131%
4111	37053	T070D	$104,386.38	$136,489.00	-$32,102.62	131%
4111	37054	T070D	$104,468.67	$136,489.00	-$32,020.33	131%
4111	37050	T070D	$104,470.15	$136,489.00	-$32,018.85	131%
4501	36140	S001U	$18,849.00	$24,507.00	-$5,658.00	130%
4111	37057	T070D	$104,152.77	$133,931.00	-$29,778.23	129%
4111	35178	E007D	$14,447.00	$18,567.27	-$4,120.27	129%
4215	37361	C005RU	$23,402.21	$30,067.00	-$6,664.79	128%
1205	37342	C003U	$14,050.75	$17,987.00	-$3,936.25	128%
1205	37710	C005RU	$24,111.60	$30,667.00	-$6,555.40	127%
4360	37107	T010U	$18,886.74	$23,791.00	-$4,904.26	126%
4501	37115	T054D	$55,362.74	$69,657.00	-$14,294.26	126%
8103	36192	S006U	$33,215.00	$41,558.00	-$8,343.00	125%
6321	37291	B16LD	$58,822.45	$72,740.00	-$13,917.55	124%
1205	37707	C007U	$25,237.62	$31,089.00	-$5,851.38	123%
4111	36163	E020D	$42,531.00	$52,280.27	-$9,749.27	123%
7101	37350	V002U	$15,318.33	$18,827.00	-$3,508.67	123%
5414	35855	T045D	$58,073.47	$71,372.00	-$13,298.53	123%
8901	37432	S006U	$23,842.69	$29,297.00	-$5,454.31	123%

TABLE 1 REPLACEMENT FEE OVERPAYMENTS						
DEPARTMENT	EQUIPMENT ID	VEHICLE CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	OVER PAID AMOUNT	% PAID
1205	37341	C003U	$14,749.43	$17,987.00	-$3,237.57	122%
4111	25118	E013D	$87,000.00	$105,881.27	-$18,881.27	122%
4111	37116	T052D	$55,384.58	$66,928.00	-$11,543.42	121%
4360	37442	T046D	$30,393.91	$36,681.00	-$6,287.09	121%
1201	37329	C005RU	$24,556.37	$29,583.00	-$5,026.63	120%
4360	37104	T010U	$19,884.02	$23,791.00	-$3,906.98	120%
4401	37089	T012D	$29,097.49	$34,782.00	-$5,684.51	120%
4360	37049	T070D	$104,011.77	$123,875.00	-$19,863.23	119%
1201	37339	C003U	$15,171.50	$17,987.00	-$2,815.50	119%
1205	37535	C006U	$23,349.06	$27,556.00	-$4,206.94	118%
4111	36374	E004D	$43,960.13	$51,738.00	-$7,777.87	118%
4360	37119	T052D	$54,685.68	$64,021.00	-$9,335.32	117%
4111	37201	T070D	$108,616.25	$127,061.00	-$18,444.75	117%
9143	37137	V008U	$18,118.08	$21,059.00	-$2,940.92	116%
4111	37200	T070D	$109,462.88	$127,061.00	-$17,598.12	116%
4111	37199	T070D	$109,603.11	$127,061.00	-$17,457.89	116%
4111	37198	T070D	$109,639.97	$127,061.00	-$17,421.03	116%
4111	37196	T070D	$109,678.46	$127,061.00	-$17,382.54	116%
4111	37195	T070D	$109,693.70	$127,061.00	-$17,367.30	116%
5414	37117	T047D	$38,660.66	$44,778.00	-$6,117.34	116%
8103	37595	C007U	$27,564.78	$31,913.00	-$4,348.22	116%
4111	37197	T070D	$109,824.46	$127,061.00	-$17,236.54	116%
4111	37168	E003D	$68,637.63	$78,665.00	-$10,027.37	115%
8101	37596	C007U	$28,034.48	$31,913.00	-$3,878.52	114%
4111	37003	T085D	$113,589.35	$129,234.00	-$15,644.65	114%
4360	37443	T046D	$32,761.38	$36,681.00	-$3,919.62	112%
5201	37323	C005RU	$24,844.93	$27,801.00	-$2,956.07	112%
6030	37226	C001H	$21,904.41	$24,340.00	-$2,435.59	111%
4111	37082	E025D	$67,454.60	$74,902.00	-$7,447.40	111%
9051	37560	V002U	$14,206.72	$15,732.00	-$1,525.28	111%
4360	37111	T046D	$38,790.55	$42,886.00	-$4,095.45	111%
4360	37118	T046D	$38,831.10	$42,886.00	-$4,054.90	110%
1205	37969	C007U	$24,242.21	$26,742.00	-$2,499.79	110%
4111	36315	E012D	$217,528.00	$239,561.00	-$22,033.00	110%
1205	37740	C006U	$23,266.77	$25,426.00	-$2,159.23	109%
4501	34407	V004U	$21,233.00	$23,073.00	-$1,840.00	109%
1205	37967	C007U	$24,700.50	$26,742.00	-$2,041.50	108%
1205	37966	C007U	$24,715.46	$26,742.00	-$2,026.54	108%
4111	36381	E012D	$218,331.94	$235,778.00	-$17,446.06	108%
4501	37088	S001U	$18,987.63	$20,445.00	-$1,457.37	108%
4360	37124	E003D	$68,401.04	$73,637.00	-$5,235.96	108%

TABLE 1 REPLACEMENT FEE OVERPAYMENTS						
DEPARTMENT	EQUIPMENT ID	VEHICLE CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	OVER PAID AMOUNT	% PAID
4111	37756	E020D	$31,588.41	$33,897.00	-$2,308.59	107%
1205	37805	C007U	$27,447.55	$29,441.00	-$1,993.45	107%
4111	35876	E030D	$49,500.00	$53,065.27	-$3,565.27	107%
1205	37970	C007U	$24,965.21	$26,742.00	-$1,776.79	107%
1201	37540	C005RU	$23,100.51	$24,643.00	-$1,542.49	107%
6030	37227	C001H	$22,868.83	$24,340.00	-$1,471.17	106%
4111	37120	T046D	$42,545.12	$44,983.00	-$2,437.88	106%
1205	37807	C005RU	$27,266.21	$28,597.00	-$1,330.79	105%
1205	37750	C007U	$27,709.31	$28,999.00	-$1,289.69	105%
1250	37555	C005RU	$26,897.88	$28,095.00	-$1,197.12	104%
4360	37113	T046D	$42,514.29	$44,148.00	-$1,633.71	104%
1204	37566	T001U	$13,830.00	$14,321.00	-$491.00	104%
4360	37424	E020D	$39,993.70	$41,202.00	-$1,208.30	103%
4115	35861	T036U	$33,101.75	$34,098.00	-$996.25	103%
4301	37087	S001U	$18,849.05	$19,409.00	-$559.95	103%
1205	37964	C006U	$21,871.00	$22,350.00	-$479.00	102%
4360	37110	T046D	$44,168.43	$44,983.00	-$814.57	102%
4001	37541	C005RU	$24,444.27	$24,719.00	-$274.73	101%
4360	37428	E026D	$61,065.10	$61,689.00	-$623.90	101%
4310	37389	T070D	$110,283.67	$111,409.00	-$1,125.33	101%
7701	37736	B14LD	$56,564.97	$56,757.00	-$192.03	100%
4301	37086	S001U	$19,494.25	$19,557.00	-$62.75	100%
				184 Vehicles	-$2,368,124.30	

TABLE 2 OVERPAYMENTS BY DEPT.	
DEPARTMENT	**OVERPAYMENTS**
4111	-$1,264,186.89
1205	-$167,812.79
4360	-$154,857.11
5413	-$90,275.13
5201	-$89,913.46
4501	-$72,574.38
7101	-$67,335.99
6030	-$56,767.76
5414	-$48,765.75
4401	-$48,082.51
4215	-$35,644.86
1250	-$35,602.51
4115	-$29,833.70
8103	-$28,352.68
6321	-$25,405.62
4310	-$24,987.33
5101	-$18,749.24
4401R	-$18,023.00
1201	-$17,659.62
9171	-$16,318.00
1253	-$14,101.75
3410	-$9,050.00
8302	-$7,934.00
7421	-$5,797.73
8901	-$5,454.31
9400	-$4,713.00
8101	-$3,878.52
9143	-$2,940.92
9051	-$1,525.28
4301	-$622.70
1204	-$491.00
4001	-$274.73
7701	-$192.03
Total	**-$2,368,124.30**

Table 3 LIFECYCLE ADJUSTMENT OPPORTUNITIES	
Vehicle Class	**Average # of Years Beyond Lifecycle**
C001U	9
E007D	9
T045D	8
T036U	6.6
E026D	6
E030D	6
V010U	5.8
T007U	5.7
E003D	5.5
C004U	5.5
T083U	5
T091D	5
B14ND	5
T012D	4.7
T001U	4.6
E020D	4.3
T083D	4
T010U	3.8
E005D	3.5
E013D	3
E004D	3

Table 4 RATE MODEL ANALYSIS OF COST TO REPLACE				
Vehicle Class	Most Recent FCG Acquisition Cost	Cost to Replace Used In Rate Model	Difference between Estimated and Actual	% Difference
Tr Peeper 10 Ton T087D	$54,730.00	$113,000.00	$58,270.00	106%
Tr Lift w Bucket T086D	$47,321.00	$80,000.00	$32,679.00	69%
Tr Road Tractor T090D	$30,000.00	$45,000.00	$15,000.00	50%
Tr Dump 10 Ton HL T071D	$117,987.00	$175,000.00	$57,013.00	48%
Eq Trailer 10000 Plus E044N	$24,500.00	$36,000.00	$11,500.00	47%
Eq Compressor E007D	$14,447.00	$21,000.00	$6,553.00	45%
Tr Dump 10 Ton SPS T070D	$120,451.68	$175,000.00	$54,548.32	45%
Eq Loader Skid E020D	$31,446.00	$45,000.00	$13,554.00	43%
Van Cargo 3 Quarter Ton V009U	$23,655.88	$31,000.00	$7,344.12	31%
Bus 21 Pass B21ND	$46,032.00	$60,000.00	$13,968.00	30%
Tr Bucket T084D	$58,237.00	$75,000.00	$16,763.00	29%
Tr Dump 1.5 Ton 4WDSPS T057D	$55,000.00	$70,000.00	$15,000.00	27%
Eq Trailer 0-2999 Lb E041N	$9,500.00	$12,000.00	$2,500.00	26%
EQ Loader Standard E024D	$120,000.00	$150,000.00	$30,000.00	25%
Bus 17 Pass B17ND	$45,000.00	$55,000.00	$10,000.00	22%
Eq Sealing Machine E018D	$29,603.00	$36,000.00	$6,397.00	22%
Eq Roller Rubber Tire E017D	$46,480.00	$56,000.00	$9,520.00	20%
Tr Stakebody T091D	$31,572.90	$38,000.00	$6,427.10	20%
Tr PU 3Qtr Ton 4WDSPS T012D	$29,354.00	$34,000.00	$4,646.00	16%
Tr Tire T092D	$61,459.14	$69,000.00	$7,540.86	12%
Eq Stone Spreader E023D	$137,850.00	$154,000.00	$16,150.00	12%
Eq Mower Side & Rear E019D	$64,492.73	$72,000.00	$7,507.27	12%
Tr Util 1 Ton Service T045D	$40,407.76	$45,000.00	$4,592.24	11%
Eq Excavator Track E031D	$203,474.00	$223,000.00	$19,526.00	10%
Eq Material Handler E011D	$59,618.37	$65,000.00	$5,381.63	9%
Tr Dump 10 Ton AWD SPS T070AD	$165,233.00	$180,000.00	$14,767.00	9%
Eq Zipper Asphalt E033D	$83,730.00	$91,000.00	$7,270.00	9%
Tr Util 1 Ton T044U	$23,936.00	$26,000.00	$2,064.00	9%
Eq Grader E013D	$165,913.00	$180,000.00	$14,087.00	8%
Tr PU 1 Ton 4WD CC T016D	$28,580.00	$31,000.00	$2,420.00	8%
Eq Mower Tractor E026D	$60,949.66	$66,000.00	$5,050.34	8%
Eq 8 Inch Pump E034D	$36,100.00	$39,000.00	$2,900.00	8%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton 4WDCCSPS T039D	$36,689.00	$39,500.00	$2,811.00	8%
Eq Mower Boom E025D	$69,155.00	$74,400.00	$5,245.00	8%
Eq Loader Rubber Tire E016D	$147,170.00	$158,000.00	$10,830.00	7%
Tr PU 1 Ton 4WD CC T016U	$32,930.00	$35,350.00	$2,420.00	7%
Bus 27 Pass Lift B27LD	$51,305.00	$55,000.00	$3,695.00	7%
Eq Sweeper E032D	$162,112.00	$172,000.00	$9,888.00	6%
Eq Chipper E005D	$33,931.00	$36,000.00	$2,069.00	6%
Tr PU 1 Ton 4WDSPS T018D	$32,999.00	$35,000.00	$2,001.00	6%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton 4WD CC T039U	$26,434.00	$28,000.00	$1,566.00	6%
Eq Loader Athey E021D	$79,545.00	$84,000.00	$4,455.00	6%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton 4WD T038D	$29,384.00	$31,000.00	$1,616.00	5%
Tr Dump 1 Ton 4WDCCSPS T054D	$61,723.52	$65,000.00	$3,276.48	5%

Table 4 RATE MODEL ANALYSIS OF COST TO REPLACE				
Vehicle Class	**Most Recent FCG Acquisition Cost**	**Cost to Replace Used In Rate Model**	**Difference between Estimated and Actual**	**% Difference**
Eq Roller Vibratory E030D	$49,500.00	$52,000.00	$2,500.00	5%
Cruiser Midsize Unmarked C003U	$17,148.00	$18,000.00	$852.00	5%
Van 5 Pass V001U	$20,007.00	$21,000.00	$993.00	5%
Bus 14 Pass B14ND	$47,667.32	$50,000.00	$2,332.68	5%
Van 8 Pass V003U	$22,000.00	$23,000.00	$1,000.00	5%
SUV Compact Hybrid S001H	$26,352.00	$27,500.00	$1,148.00	4%
Bus 11 Pass Lift B11LD	$57,570.38	$60,000.00	$2,429.62	4%
Sedan Compact C001U	$11,516.00	$12,000.00	$484.00	4%
Van 12 Pass V004U	$20,199.00	$21,000.00	$801.00	4%
Tr PU Compact T000U	$15,409.00	$16,000.00	$591.00	4%
Tr PU 3Qtr Ton T007U	$19,262.00	$20,000.00	$738.00	4%
Tr PU Half Ton 4WD T004U	$22,165.00	$23,000.00	$835.00	4%
Tr PU Parks Half Ton 4WD T004PU	$22,165.00	$23,000.00	$835.00	4%
Tr PU Half Ton T001U	$19,361.00	$20,000.00	$639.00	3%
Tr Bucket Large T085D	$134,835.00	$139,000.00	$4,165.00	3%
SUV Midsize Marked AWD S004AU	$27,165.00	$28,000.00	$835.00	3%
Cruis M-S Unmarked Hybrid C003H	$23,296.00	$24,000.00	$704.00	3%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton 4WDSPS T040U	$32,097.00	$33,000.00	$903.00	3%
Cruiser Midsize Marked C004U	$15,565.00	$16,000.00	$435.00	3%
Van Cargo 1 Half Ton V008U	$29,225.20	$30,000.00	$774.80	3%
Van Cargo 1 Ton V010U	$31,184.00	$32,000.00	$816.00	3%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton T036U	$21,482.00	$22,000.00	$518.00	2%
Sedan Midsize Hybrid C002H	$32,229.34	$33,000.00	$770.66	2%
Tr Bookmobile T082D	$171,204.00	$175,000.00	$3,796.00	2%
Motorcycle M001U	$21,527.40	$22,000.00	$472.60	2%
Tr Util 1 Ton 4WDCCSPS T048U	$31,372.00	$32,000.00	$628.00	2%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton 4WD T038U	$27,472.00	$28,000.00	$528.00	2%
Tr Box 1 Ton T083U	$31,400.00	$32,000.00	$600.00	2%
Bus 14 Pass Lift B14LD	$63,829.00	$65,000.00	$1,171.00	2%
Tr Box 1 Ton T083D	$34,400.00	$35,000.00	$600.00	2%
SUV Fullsize ALS S007U	$32,449.00	$33,000.00	$551.00	2%
Van 15 Pass V005U	$30,492.00	$31,000.00	$508.00	2%
Tr Util 1 Ton 4WDSPS T047D	$51,205.76	$52,000.00	$794.24	2%
Bus 20 Pass B20NU	$59,096.00	$60,000.00	$904.00	2%
Tr PU 3Qtr Ton 4WD T010U	$30,551.00	$31,000.00	$449.00	1%
Sedan Midsize C002U	$14,793.00	$15,000.00	$207.00	1%
SUV Fullsize S005U	$37,510.00	$38,000.00	$490.00	1%
SUV Fullsize Marked S006U	$37,540.00	$38,000.00	$460.00	1%
Van 7 Pass V002U	$23,713.00	$24,000.00	$287.00	1%
Bus 16 Pass Lift B16LD	$64,223.42	$65,000.00	$776.58	1%
Tr Util 3Qtr Ton 4WDSPS T040D	$34,586.00	$35,000.00	$414.00	1%
Tr Dump 1.25 Ton 4WD T056D	$62,289.00	$63,000.00	$711.00	1%
Bus 23 Pass B23ND	$60,383.00	$61,000.00	$617.00	1%
SUV Midsize S003U	$29,712.00	$30,000.00	$288.00	1%

Table 4 RATE MODEL ANALYSIS OF COST TO REPLACE				
Vehicle Class	**Most Recent FCG Acquisition Cost**	**Cost to Replace Used In Rate Model**	**Difference between Estimated and Actual**	**% Difference**
Tr Util 1 Ton 4WD T046D	$41,645.00	$42,000.00	$355.00	1%
Sedan Compact Hybrid C001H	$29,756.34	$30,000.00	$243.66	1%
Bus 12 Pass Lift B12LU	$69,521.00	$70,000.00	$479.00	1%
Tr Dump 1 Ton 4WDSPS T052D	$61,723.52	$62,000.00	$276.48	0%
SUV Midsize AWD S003AU	$28,890.00	$29,000.00	$110.00	0%
SUV Compact S001U	$19,927.00	$20,000.00	$73.00	0%
Tr Util F550 T049D	$86,829.26	$87,000.00	$170.74	0%
Eq Roller Standard E022D	$57,957.00	$58,000.00	$43.00	0%
Eq Gradall E012D	$320,847.11	$321,000.00	$152.89	0%
Tr Dump 1 Ton T051D	$54,000.00	$54,000.00	$0.00	0%
Eq Mower Trim E029D	$66,810.35	$66,000.00	($810.35)	-1%
Eq Forklift E010U	$52,586.00	$40,000.00	($12,586.00)	-24%

Table 5 : FUEL EXCEPTION ANALYSIS			
Department	**Number of Exception Records**	**Total Gallons in Exception Report**	**Percentage of Total Exception Population**
FIRE & RESCUE	145	1929.898	**36.337%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	141	1896.527	35.708%
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	4	33.371	0.628%
WATER & SEWER	39	1285.203	**24.198%**
Fuel volume exceeds vehicles tank capacity	7	314.029	5.913%
Odometer entry is out of sequence	30	954.274	17.967%
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	2	16.9	0.318%
HIGHWAY	29	710.676	**13.381%**
Fuel volume exceeds vehicles tank capacity	5	155.592	2.930%
Odometer entry is out of sequence	20	468.273	8.817%
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	4	86.811	1.634%
OFF ROAD WATER & SEWER	12	561.902	**10.580%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	9	531.091	10.000%
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	3	30.811	0.580%
SHERIFF	31	374.799	**7.057%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	30	365.687	6.885%
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	1	9.112	0.172%
OFF ROAD HIGHWAY	7	260.464	**4.904%**
Fuel volume exceeds vehicles tank capacity	1	60.033	1.130%
Odometer entry is out of sequence	6	200.431	3.774%
PARKS DEPT.	2	46.394	**0.874%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	2	46.394	0.874%
FAMILY PARTNERSHIP	2	27.333	**0.515%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	1	7.907	0.149%
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	1	19.426	0.366%
ADV. LIFE SUPPORT	5	25.878	**0.487%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	5	25.878	0.487%
FIRE MARSHALL	1	20.799	**0.392%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	1	20.799	0.392%
STATES ATTORNEY	1	19.246	**0.362%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	1	19.246	0.362%
TRANSIT	1	17.165	**0.323%**
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	1	17.165	0.323%
CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT	1	11.216	**0.211%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	1	11.216	0.211%
COUNTY COMMISSIONERS	1	10.526	**0.198%**
Veh is restricted from purchasing this fuel	1	10.526	0.198%
MAINTENANCE	1	9.673	**0.182%**
Odometer entry is out of sequence	1	9.673	0.182%
Grand Total	**278**	**5311.172**	**100.000%**

Table 6 ACTIVE INVENTORY ANALYSIS OF MAINTENANCE COSTS VS. ACQUISITON COST										
EQUIPMENT	DEPARTMENT	CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	REMAINING BALANCE	Total Work Order Cost (WOC)	(WOC) Percentage of Acquisition Cost	Number of Years Active	Listed Lifecycle	Years Past Listed Lifecycle
36158	4111	E019D	$ 61,331.00	$ 116,746.27	$ (55,415.27)	$ 190,351.41	310%	14	5	9
36168	4111	T047D	$ 33,469.00	$ 53,991.00	$ (20,522.00)	$ 94,876.91	283%	14	7.7	6.3
36086	5413	T083D	$ 26,460.00	$ 38,630.00	$ (12,170.00)	$ 66,817.08	253%	15	8	7
36497	4111	T091D	$ 31,572.90	$ 42,765.00	$ (11,192.10)	$ 66,158.13	210%	13	8	5
36162	4111	E025D	$ 62,109.19	$ 94,310.27	$ (32,201.08)	$ 122,057.15	197%	14	10	4
37736	7701	B14LD	$ 56,564.97	$ 56,757.00	$ (192.03)	$ 106,122.23	188%	10	8	2
36013	4111	T054D	$ 54,035.94	$ 81,751.88	$ (27,715.94)	$ 99,757.57	185%	15	8	7
37512	4111	T054D	$ 59,575.03	$ 56,872.00	$ 2,703.03	$ 104,420.66	175%	10	8	2
37514	4111	T054D	$ 59,083.38	$ 56,872.00	$ 2,211.38	$ 102,618.03	174%	10	8	2
35991	4111	E044N	$ 8,998.00	$ 17,043.27	$ (8,045.27)	$ 15,260.85	170%	15	15	0
37990	4111	T090D	$ 36,104.88	$ 19,427.00	$ 16,677.88	$ 57,023.47	158%	8	15	-7
37585	4111	E025D	$ 69,293.16	$ 57,771.00	$ 11,522.16	$ 107,346.08	155%	10	10	0
35837	4111	E013D	$ 74,500.00	$ 111,791.27	$ (37,291.27)	$ 115,397.33	155%	16	15	1
37111	4360	T046D	$ 38,790.55	$ 42,886.00	$ (4,095.45)	$ 58,633.37	151%	12	7.7	4.3
37443	4360	T046D	$ 32,761.38	$ 36,681.00	$ (3,919.62)	$ 46,292.31	141%	11	7.7	3.3
37861	4401R	T001U	$ 16,166.34	$ 10,739.00	$ 5,427.34	$ 22,646.37	140%	9	7	2
36374	4111	E004D	$ 43,960.13	$ 51,738.00	$ (7,777.87)	$ 60,895.53	139%	13	10	3
37120	4111	T046D	$ 42,545.12	$ 44,983.00	$ (2,437.88)	$ 57,641.90	135%	12	7.7	4.3
36311	4115	T001U	$ 12,143.00	$ 19,981.00	$ (7,838.00)	$ 16,242.41	134%	13	7	6
38107	4111	E019D	$ 65,092.43	$ 51,946.00	$ 13,146.43	$ 86,690.13	133%	8	5	3
37146	8103	S007U	$ 23,543.54	$ 39,205.00	$ (15,661.46)	$ 31,093.15	132%	12	8	4
37168	4111	E003D	$ 68,637.63	$ 78,665.00	$ (10,027.37)	$ 88,846.95	129%	12	5.5	6.5
36499	5101	T083D	$ 40,407.76	$ 59,157.00	$ (18,749.24)	$ 52,124.67	129%	13	8	5
36191	4111	T070D	$ 95,118.72	$ 153,907.00	$ (58,788.28)	$ 122,316.95	129%	14	8.5	5.5
36321	4111	T070D	$ 98,454.05	$ 145,329.00	$ (46,874.95)	$ 126,092.91	128%	13	8.5	4.5
37511	4111	T054D	$ 59,469.92	$ 56,872.00	$ 2,597.92	$ 76,112.43	128%	10	8	2
36313	4401R	T004U	$ 15,098.00	$ 21,649.00	$ (6,551.00)	$ 18,964.25	126%	13	7	6
36083	4401	T010U	$ 17,596.00	$ 30,056.00	$ (12,460.00)	$ 22,076.45	125%	15	8	7
36324	4111	T070D	$ 98,454.05	$ 145,329.00	$ (46,874.95)	$ 121,762.84	124%	13	8.5	4.5
37053	4111	T070D	$ 104,386.38	$ 136,489.00	$ (32,102.62)	$ 128,422.11	123%	12	8.5	3.5

Table 6 ACTIVE INVENTORY ANALYSIS OF MAINTENANCE COSTS VS. ACQUISITON COST										
EQUIPMENT	DEPARTMENT	CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	REMAINING BALANCE	Total Work Order Cost (WOC)	(WOC) Percentage of Acquisition Cost	Number of Years Active	Listed Lifecycle	Years Past Listed Lifecycle
35784	4111	E003D	$ 62,800.00	$ 94,145.27	$ (31,345.27)	$ 76,202.24	121%	16	5.5	10.5
37102	4115	T001U	$ 12,728.09	$ 18,123.00	$ (5,394.91)	$ 15,342.92	121%	12	7	5
35722	5414	T004U	$ 16,397.00	$ 25,010.00	$ (8,613.00)	$ 19,434.34	119%	17	7	10
37116	4111	T052D	$ 55,384.58	$ 66,928.00	$ (11,543.42)	$ 65,627.57	118%	12	8	4
37488	4111	E003D	$ 74,592.32	$ 65,406.00	$ 9,186.32	$ 86,257.86	116%	10	5.5	4.5
35803	5201	V010U	$ 15,798.00	$ 31,588.00	$ (15,790.00)	$ 18,188.67	115%	16	7	9
36161	4111	E025D	$ 62,109.19	$ 94,310.27	$ (32,201.08)	$ 70,339.44	113%	14	10	4
37481	4111	T052D	$ 58,621.32	$ 56,853.00	$ 1,768.32	$ 66,161.83	113%	11	8	3
35804	5201	V010U	$ 15,798.00	$ 31,822.00	$ (16,024.00)	$ 17,812.04	113%	16	7	9
37054	4111	T070D	$ 104,468.67	$ 136,489.00	$ (32,020.33)	$ 116,985.31	112%	12	8.5	3.5
37082	4111	E025D	$ 67,454.60	$ 74,902.00	$ (7,447.40)	$ 75,287.29	112%	12	10	2
35992	4111	E044N	$ 8,998.00	$ 17,043.27	$ (8,045.27)	$ 10,037.76	112%	15	15	0
36098	4360	T040D	$ 29,581.00	$ 44,236.00	$ (14,655.00)	$ 32,739.43	111%	15	8	7
35990	4111	E044N	$ 8,998.00	$ 17,043.27	$ (8,045.27)	$ 9,929.70	110%	15	15	0
37907	4310	S001U	$ 19,653.93	$ 12,248.00	$ 7,405.93	$ 21,199.73	108%	9	8	1
37540	1201	C005RU	$ 23,100.51	$ 24,643.00	$ (1,542.49)	$ 24,715.31	107%	10	N/A	N/A
36165	4111	E044N	$ 9,500.00	$ 16,905.00	$ (7,405.00)	$ 10,013.97	105%	14	15	-1
36087	5201	V010U	$ 15,722.00	$ 31,560.00	$ (15,838.00)	$ 16,504.73	105%	15	7	8
37478	4111	T070D	$ 116,029.43	$ 114,157.00	$ 1,872.43	$ 119,630.78	103%	10	8.5	1.5
35734	8302	T001U	$ 13,609.00	$ 21,543.00	$ (7,934.00)	$ 13,955.21	103%	17	7	10
37056	4111	T070D	$ 104,326.49	$ 136,489.00	$ (32,162.51)	$ 106,899.34	102%	12	8.5	3.5
37325	5201	C005RU	$ 24,849.65	$ 37,213.00	$ (12,363.35)	$ 25,355.14	102%	11	N/A	N/A
37555	1250	C005RU	$ 26,897.88	$ 28,095.00	$ (1,197.12)	$ 27,442.49	102%	10	N/A	N/A
37057	4111	T070D	$ 104,152.77	$ 133,931.00	$ (29,778.23)	$ 106,146.23	102%	12	8.5	3.5
35836	4111	E013D	$ 74,500.00	$ 111,791.27	$ (37,291.27)	$ 75,500.20	101%	16	15	1
37754	4111	E003D	$ 76,603.56	$ 60,741.00	$ 15,862.56	$ 77,187.24	101%	9	5.5	3.5
37329	1201	C005RU	$ 24,556.37	$ 29,583.00	$ (5,026.63)	$ 24,593.35	100%	11	N/A	N/A
37051	4111	T070D	$ 104,096.09	$ 136,489.00	$ (32,392.91)	$ 103,990.77	100%	12	8.5	3.5
37889	6321	B16LD	$ 60,657.29	$ 54,633.00	$ 6,024.29	$ 60,489.66	100%	9	8.5	0.5
36069	1205	C006U	$ 17,562.00	$ 41,989.00	$ (24,427.00)	$ 17,477.41	100%	15	5.5	9.5

Table 6 ACTIVE INVENTORY ANALYSIS OF MAINTENANCE COSTS VS. ACQUISITON COST										
EQUIPMENT	DEPARTMENT	CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	REMAINING BALANCE	Total Work Order Cost (WOC)	(WOC) Percentage of Acquisition Cost	Number of Years Active	Listed Lifecycle	Years Past Listed Lifecycle
37541	4001	C005RU	$ 24,444.27	$ 24,719.00	$ (274.73)	$ 24,061.73	98%	10	N/A	N/A
37201	4111	T070D	$ 108,616.25	$ 127,061.00	$ (18,444.75)	$ 106,752.44	98%	11	8.5	2.5
38044	4111	T047D	$ 51,697.28	$ 32,780.00	$ 18,917.28	$ 50,281.53	97%	8	7.7	0.3
36073	7101	B14ND	$ 40,934.34	$ 72,848.00	$ (31,913.66)	$ 39,285.18	96%	15	8	7
37321	5413	C005RU	$ 24,606.46	$ 35,947.00	$ (11,340.54)	$ 23,454.10	95%	11	N/A	N/A
37565	4215	T001U	$ 17,896.70	$ 14,321.00	$ 3,575.70	$ 17,037.56	95%	10	7	3
35848	5413	T001U	$ 13,609.00	$ 20,517.00	$ (6,908.00)	$ 12,932.65	95%	16	7	9
37086	4301	S001U	$ 19,494.25	$ 19,557.00	$ (62.75)	$ 18,469.57	95%	12	8	4
36192	8103	S006U	$ 33,215.00	$ 41,558.00	$ (8,343.00)	$ 31,360.13	94%	14	8	6
36316	5414	T004U	$ 15,098.00	$ 22,813.00	$ (7,715.00)	$ 14,162.23	94%	13	7	6
35864	4501	T012D	$ 28,909.00	$ 47,905.00	$ (18,996.00)	$ 27,116.96	94%	16	8	8
37864	4111	T054D	$ 62,201.34	$ 47,117.00	$ 15,084.34	$ 58,196.40	94%	9	8	1
37200	4111	T070D	$ 109,462.88	$ 127,061.00	$ (17,598.12)	$ 102,267.08	93%	11	8.5	2.5
37477	4111	T070D	$ 116,167.65	$ 114,157.00	$ 2,010.65	$ 108,406.74	93%	10	8.5	1.5
37484	4111	T070D	$ 116,554.03	$ 111,853.00	$ 4,701.03	$ 108,722.61	93%	10	8.5	1.5
37052	4111	T070D	$ 104,091.84	$ 136,489.00	$ (32,397.16)	$ 96,999.17	93%	12	8.5	3.5
37427	4111	E025D	$ 69,411.54	$ 64,448.00	$ 4,963.54	$ 64,499.38	93%	11	10	1
37291	6321	B16LD	$ 58,822.45	$ 72,740.00	$ (13,917.55)	$ 54,621.36	93%	11	8.5	2.5
36362	9171	C005RU	$ 20,476.00	$ 36,794.00	$ (16,318.00)	$ 18,996.58	93%	13	N/A	N/A
36326	4111	T070D	$ 98,454.05	$ 145,329.00	$ (46,874.95)	$ 91,189.28	93%	13	8.5	4.5
37118	4360	T046D	$ 38,831.10	$ 42,886.00	$ (4,054.90)	$ 35,804.97	92%	12	7.7	4.3
36322	4111	T070D	$ 98,454.05	$ 145,329.00	$ (46,874.95)	$ 90,392.43	92%	13	8.5	4.5
35806	1201	C003U	$ 15,800.00	$ 24,075.00	$ (8,275.00)	$ 14,403.94	91%	16	7	9
35499	4115	T001U	$ 13,609.00	$ 21,375.54	$ (7,766.54)	$ 12,406.52	91%	17	7	10
37584	4111	E025D	$ 69,295.28	$ 57,771.00	$ 11,524.28	$ 62,911.88	91%	10	10	0
36390	4501	T052D	$ 52,185.25	$ 72,735.00	$ (20,549.75)	$ 47,360.97	91%	13	8	5
33264	5201	V010U	$ 17,080.00	$ 31,822.00	$ (14,742.00)	$ 15,367.82	90%	19	7	12
38042	4111	T047D	$ 52,829.48	$ 32,780.00	$ 20,049.48	$ 47,527.79	90%	8	7.7	0.3
37361	4215	C005RU	$ 23,402.21	$ 30,067.00	$ (6,664.79)	$ 21,010.02	90%	11	N/A	N/A
36071	6030	T001U	$ 11,719.00	$ 21,401.00	$ (9,682.00)	$ 10,378.39	89%	15	7	8

Table 6 ACTIVE INVENTORY ANALYSIS OF MAINTENANCE COSTS VS. ACQUISITON COST										
EQUIPMENT	DEPARTMENT	CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	REMAINING BALANCE	Total Work Order Cost (WOC)	(WOC) Percentage of Acquisition Cost	Number of Years Active	Listed Lifecycle	Years Past Listed Lifecycle
37115	4501	T054D	$ 55,362.74	$ 69,657.00	$ (14,294.26)	$ 48,258.03	87%	12	8	4
35801	4360	V010U	$ 15,798.00	$ 29,897.00	$ (14,099.00)	$ 13,712.25	87%	16	7	9
37969	1205	C007U	$ 24,242.21	$ 26,742.00	$ (2,499.79)	$ 20,995.10	87%	9	5.2	3.8
37751	1201	C005RU	$ 29,839.55	$ 27,733.00	$ 2,106.55	$ 25,717.23	86%	9	#N/A	#N/A
36312	4115	T001U	$ 12,143.00	$ 19,981.00	$ (7,838.00)	$ 10,414.12	86%	13	7	6
35780	4401R	T007U	$ 17,852.00	$ 29,324.00	$ (11,472.00)	$ 14,971.09	84%	16	8	8
37544	5413	C005RU	$ 26,374.82	$ 24,643.00	$ 1,731.82	$ 22,103.96	84%	10	#N/A	#N/A
36184	4111	E005D	$ 22,905.00	$ 33,502.00	$ (10,597.00)	$ 19,170.42	84%	14	9	5
36186	4111	T070D	$ 95,118.72	$ 153,907.00	$ (58,788.28)	$ 79,433.77	84%	14	8.5	5.5
35733	4401	T001U	$ 13,609.00	$ 20,346.00	$ (6,737.00)	$ 11,363.77	84%	17	7	10
37055	4111	T070D	$ 104,156.10	$ 136,489.00	$ (32,332.90)	$ 86,829.20	83%	12	8.5	3.5
37620	8101	C005RU	$ 23,591.42	$ 19,509.00	$ 4,082.42	$ 19,577.66	83%	10	#N/A	#N/A
36473	4215	C005RU	$ 22,913.41	$ 33,051.00	$ (10,137.59)	$ 18,935.42	83%	12	N/A	N/A
30462	4111	E044N	$ 24,500.00	$ 22,043.27	$ 2,456.73	$ 20,228.17	83%	23	15	8
37828	6321	B14ND	$ 47,667.32	$ 44,980.00	$ 2,687.32	$ 39,118.38	82%	9	8	1
37897	4360	T047D	$ 45,215.64	$ 35,654.00	$ 9,561.64	$ 37,029.99	82%	9	7.7	1.3
37753	4111	E003D	$ 75,880.74	$ 60,741.00	$ 15,139.74	$ 61,749.37	81%	9	5.5	3.5
35973	6030	C001U	$ 10,118.00	$ 16,860.00	$ (6,742.00)	$ 8,170.20	81%	15	6.5	8.5
37862	5413	T004U	$ 21,542.49	$ 10,868.00	$ 10,674.49	$ 17,316.41	80%	9	7	2
37476	4111	T070D	$ 116,170.82	$ 115,309.00	$ 861.82	$ 92,958.97	80%	10	8.5	1.5
37199	4111	T070D	$ 109,603.11	$ 127,061.00	$ (17,457.89)	$ 87,623.52	80%	11	8.5	2.5
36325	4111	T070D	$ 98,454.05	$ 142,771.00	$ (44,316.95)	$ 78,681.87	80%	13	8.5	4.5
37888	6321	B16LD	$ 60,647.92	$ 54,633.00	$ 6,014.92	$ 48,003.96	79%	9	8.5	0.5
36323	4111	T070D	$ 98,454.05	$ 145,329.00	$ (46,874.95)	$ 77,595.60	79%	13	8.5	4.5
37755	4111	E003D	$ 76,046.56	$ 60,741.00	$ 15,305.56	$ 59,923.89	79%	9	5.5	3.5
36333	1205	C003U	$ 12,489.00	$ 22,271.00	$ (9,782.00)	$ 9,839.24	79%	13	7	6
36458	5413	C005RU	$ 21,068.00	$ 41,131.00	$ (20,063.00)	$ 16,577.53	79%	13	N/A	N/A
37107	4360	T010U	$ 18,886.74	$ 23,791.00	$ (4,904.26)	$ 14,817.57	78%	12	8	4
38105	4111	E019D	$ 65,476.62	$ 51,946.00	$ 13,530.62	$ 51,277.47	78%	8	5	3
35410	4111	E013D	$ 144,950.00	$ 111,791.27	$ 33,158.73	$ 113,124.13	78%	17	15	2

Table 6 ACTIVE INVENTORY ANALYSIS OF MAINTENANCE COSTS VS. ACQUISITON COST										
EQUIPMENT	DEPARTMENT	CLASS	ACQUIRE COST	RECOVERY COLLECTED	REMAINING BALANCE	Total Work Order Cost (WOC)	(WOC) Percentage of Acquisition Cost	Number of Years Active	Listed Lifecycle	Years Past Listed Lifecycle
37964	1205	C006U	$ 21,871.00	$ 22,350.00	$ (479.00)	$ 16,993.15	78%	9	5.5	3.5
35893	6030	C001U	$ 10,921.00	$ 16,860.00	$ (5,939.00)	$ 8,424.69	77%	16	6.5	9.5
35796	4310	T036U	$ 20,142.00	$ 32,073.00	$ (11,931.00)	$ 15,513.89	77%	16	8	8
36348	4360	V010U	$ 16,367.00	$ 26,753.00	$ (10,386.00)	$ 12,545.10	77%	13	7	6
34407	4501	V004U	$ 21,233.00	$ 23,073.00	$ (1,840.00)	$ 16,221.78	76%	18	8	10
34217	4111	E005D	$ 21,818.00	$ 32,240.27	$ (10,422.27)	$ 16,664.90	76%	18	9	9
37554	4215	C005RU	$ 26,329.07	$ 24,263.00	$ 2,066.07	$ 20,079.09	76%	10	#N/A	#N/A
35886	6030	C001U	$ 10,921.00	$ 16,860.00	$ (5,939.00)	$ 8,292.48	76%	16	6.5	9.5
36486	4215	C005RU	$ 23,927.52	$ 34,836.00	$ (10,908.48)	$ 18,089.65	76%	12	N/A	N/A
37196	4111	T070D	$ 109,678.46	$ 127,061.00	$ (17,382.54)	$ 82,865.12	76%	11	8.5	2.5
37341	1205	C003U	$ 14,749.43	$ 17,987.00	$ (3,237.57)	$ 11,141.60	76%	11	7	4
37198	4111	T070D	$ 109,639.97	$ 127,061.00	$ (17,421.03)	$ 82,740.79	75%	11	8.5	2.5